



**Banw Community Primary School and
Llanerfyl Church in Wales (Foundation)
School**

Consultation Report

February 2019

CONTENTS

	Page
1. Overview of the Consultation	3
1.1 Consultation methods	3
1.2 Responses received	4
1.3 Summary of issues raised	4
2. Consultation Response Form	7
3. Consultation with Pupils	9
4. Consultation meetings with Governors and Staff	14
5. Estyn	17
6. Issues raised during the Consultation Period	21
1. Comments on the principle of merging the two schools	21
2. Comments about Banw C.P. School	27
3. Comments about Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School	42
4. Category of any new school	64
5. Impact on pupils	79
6. Pupil numbers	85
7. Impact on staff	91
8. Impact on the community	93
9. Impact on the Welsh Language	102
10. Reference to Early Years provision	106
11. Financial considerations	106
12. Other options	114
13. Reference to documentation	119
14. Comments relating to the process	124



CONSULTATION ON PROPOSALS RELATING TO BANW C.P. SCHOOL AND LLANERFYL C. IN W. (FOUNDATION) SCHOOL

1. OVERVIEW OF THE CONSULTATION

Powys County Council consulted on the following proposals relating to Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School:

- To close Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. Foundation School and to establish a new Welsh-medium Voluntary Aided Church in Wales School
- To establish the new school either
 - a. on the current site of Banw C.P. School **or**
 - b. on the current site of Llanerfyl C. in W. Foundation School

The consultation took place from the 24th September 2018 to the 5th November 2018.

1.1 Consultation methods

The consultation documentation was available on the Council's website throughout the consultation period, and was distributed to stakeholders, as required by the School Organisation Code (2013). A separate version for primary aged pupils was also available and distributed to pupils, and was also available on the Council's website throughout the consultation period.

Consultees were invited to respond to the consultation by either completing an online consultation form, filling in a paper copy of the form and returning it to the School Transformation Team at County Hall, or by e-mailing / writing to the School Transformation Team.

Informal drop in sessions were held to give parents the opportunity to discuss any queries with officers / county councillors. These were held in Llanerfyl Village Hall on Thursday 4th October 2018 and in Banw Community Centre on Monday 15th October 2018. Approximately 40 attended the session in Llanerfyl, and approximately 110 attended the session in Banw.

In addition, meetings were held with the following:

- Staff and Governors of Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School – 4th October 2018
- Staff and Governors of Banw C.P. School – 15th October 2018
- School Council of Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School – 24th October 2018
- School Council of Banw C.P. School – 24th October 2018

1.2 Responses received

A total of 250 respondents completed the consultation response form which was included in the consultation document. This included paper copies as well as responses submitted using the online response form.

In addition 51 written responses were received.

In addition to responses from parents, staff, governors, pupils and other members of the community affected by the proposal, responses were received from the following:

- Estyn
- Diocese of St Asaph
- Llanerfyl Village Hall Committee
- Banwy Community Council
- Dyffryn Banw Football Club
- Merched y Wawr, Montgomeryshire Region
- Llanerfyl Community Council
- Cylch Meithrin Dyffryn Banw
- Banw Community Centre Committee
- UCAC

The response received from Estyn is provided on page 17, in-line with the requirements of the School Organisation Code.

1.3 Summary of issues raised

The issues raised in the consultation responses are listed in detail in section 6 on page 21. This includes the Council's response to each issue.

However, the following is a summary of the issues raised:

1. Comments on the principle of merging the two schools

- 1.1 In support
- 1.2 Against
- 1.3 Other

2. Comments about Banw C.P. School

- 2.1 Location
- 2.2 Building Condition
- 2.3 Building Suitability
- 2.4 Reference to the new curriculum
- 2.5 The school site
- 2.6 Parking
- 2.7 Size
- 2.8 Classroom configuration
- 2.9 Toilets / Changing Facilities
- 2.10 Kitchen / Dining Facilities

- 2.11 Hall
- 2.12 Reference to links between the school and the community
- 2.13 Disabled access
- 2.14 Safeguarding
- 2.15 Opportunities to develop the site
- 2.16 Possible alternative uses should there be no school on the site
- 2.17 Other

3. Comments about Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School

- 3.1 Location
- 3.2 Building Condition
- 3.3 Building Suitability
- 3.4 The School Site
- 3.5 Parking
- 3.6 Classroom Configuration
- 3.7 Reference to the new curriculum
- 3.8 Toilets / Changing Facilities
- 3.9 Kitchen / Dining Facilities
- 3.10 Hall
- 3.11 Community Use / Links
- 3.12 Disabled Access
- 3.13 Health and Safety queries
- 3.14 Opportunities to develop the site
- 3.15 Possible alternative uses should there be no school on the site
- 3.16 Successes of Ysgol Llanerfyl

4. Category of any new school

- 4.1 Church in Wales categorisation
- 4.2 Voluntary Aided Church in Wales categorisation
- 4.3 Other categories

5. Impact on pupils

- 5.1 Additional travel
- 5.2 Impact on vulnerable pupils
- 5.3 Impact on quality of education
- 5.4 Other

6. Pupil numbers

- 6.1 It's unfair to close Llanerfyl School
- 6.2 Surplus places
- 6.3 Projected pupil numbers

7. Impact on staff

8. Impact on the community

- 8.1 Impact on the Banw Community

- 8.2 Impact on the Llanerfyl community
- 8.3 General comments with regard to impact on the community

9. Impact on the Welsh Language

- 9.1 Impact on the Welsh language in the Banw community
- 9.2 Impact on the Welsh language in the Llanerfyl community
- 9.3 General comments with regard to impact on the Welsh language

10. Reference to Early Years provision

11. Financial considerations

- 11.1 Transport costs
- 11.2 Capital receipts
- 11.3 Capital costs
- 11.4 Cost per pupil
- 11.5 Reference to financial contribution from the Church
- 11.6 Priscilla Foster Trust
- 11.7 Overall savings to the Council

12. Other options

- 12.1 Retain both schools
- 12.2 Open a new school in a new location
- 12.3 Multi-sited option
- 12.4 Establish English-medium provision in the area
- 12.5 Carry out a wider review of education in the area
- 12.6 Increase pupil numbers in the area
- 12.7 Other

13. Reference to documentation

- 13.1 Consultation Document
- 13.2 Impact assessments
- 13.3 HoWPS building reports

14. Comments relating to the process

- 14.1 Initial meetings with governing bodies
- 14.2 Informal session for parents held on the 7th February 2018
- 14.3 Parents questionnaire Spring 2018
- 14.4 Decision making process
- 14.5 Reference to Cabinet meeting 18th July 2018
- 14.6 Reference to the consultation process
- 14.7 Reference to process going forward
- 14.8 Reference to legal challenge / judicial review
- 14.9 Reference to County Councillors
- 14.10 Impact of the process on the community

2. CONSULTATION RESPONSE FORM

250 respondents completed the consultation response form which was included in the consultation document. This included paper copies as well as responses submitted using the online response form.

The quantitative findings of the questionnaire are summarised below. Written comments were also provided in the consultation response forms, the issues raised in these comments are included in Section 6 of this report.

Section 1 – About you

1. Please indicate how you are associated with Banw C.P. School and/or Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School:

Parent, carer or guardian	43	17%
Prospective parent, carer or guardian	26	10%
Governor	14	6%
Member of staff	14	6%
Member of the community	118	47%
No association with either school	17	7%
Other	66	26%
Total responses ¹	250	

2. Please specify which school you are associated with:

Banw C.P. School	101	40%
Llanerfyl C. in W. School	110	44%
Neither school	51	20%
Total responses ²	250	

Section 2 – Consultation Response

3. Given the current and projected pupil numbers in Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School, do you agree that the most suitable way forward is for the two existing schools to merge in order to establish one new, larger school in the area?

Yes	189	83%
No	33	14%
Don't know	7	3%
Total responses	229	100%

4. The current proposal is to establish a new Welsh-medium Voluntary Aided Church in Wales School. If the Council were to proceed with merging the two

¹ Some respondents gave more than one response for this question. This is why the total is higher than 250.

² Some respondents gave more than one response for this question. This is why the total is higher than 250.

existing schools to create one new school, do you agree that 'Voluntary Aided Church in Wales' would be a suitable category for a new school?

Yes	105	46%
No	48	21%
Don't know	74	33%
Total responses	227	100%

5. If the Council were to proceed with merging the two existing schools to create one new school, do you agree that establishing a new school on the current site of Banw C.P. School would be a suitable way forward in order to safeguard the provision of Welsh-medium education in the Banw Valley?

Yes	140	61%
No	81	35%
Don't know	8	4%
Total responses	229	100%

6. If the Council were to proceed with merging the two existing schools to create one new school, do you agree that establishing a new school on the current site of Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School would be a suitable way forward in order to safeguard the provision of Welsh-medium education in the Banw Valley?

Yes	81	36%
No	130	57%
Don't know	16	7%
Total responses	227	100%

7. A number of options have been considered in respect of Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School. Option 1 (Establish a new school operating across the two sites) and Option 4 (Establish a new school operating from a new site in the area) have been discounted as the Council does not think that either of these are the most appropriate way forward at the current time.

- a) Do you agree with the Council that these options should be discounted?

Yes	154	76%
No	20	10%
Don't know	28	14%
Total responses	203	100%

- b) Do you think the Council should proceed with one of the discounted options instead of the current options?

Yes	30	15%
No	140	71%
Don't know	26	13%
Total responses	196	99%

3. CONSULTATION WITH PUPILS

Officers from the local authority met with the School Council of Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School to get their views on the proposals. The notes of these meetings are provided below:

i) Banw C.P. School

Officers from the School Transformation Team met with Dyffryn Banw School Council on 24 October 2018 to discuss the consultation on the future of Ysgol Dyffryn Banw and Ysgol Llanerfyl.

One session was held with 8 pupils from the school council.

The officers explained the proposals in relation to Dyffryn Banw Primary School and the Llanerfyl Church in Wales (Foundation) School, namely:

- To close Dyffryn Banw Primary School and Llanerfyl Church in Wales (Foundation) School and to establish a Welsh-medium Church in Wales Voluntary Aided School.
- To establish the new school either
 - a. On the current site of Dyffryn Banw Primary School **or**
 - b. On the current site of Llanerfyl Primary School

The pupils were asked a number of questions and their responses are summarised below:

1. What do you like about Ysgol Dyffryn Banw? What's good about the school?

- The park and the large hall
- The yard for playing netball
- A good place to do exercise and sports
- A good place to do athletics with a 200 metr running track
- A good place to do the long jump
- 4 classrooms so we study maths and language in different rooms
- Many computers
- The hall is good for sports if it rains
- The hall is good for concerts, Eisteddfod y Foel. The Powys Eisteddfod is also coming here
- A good hall for gymnastics
- A large canteen and kitchen
- An after school cooking club
- There is a kitchen by the hall as well
- A breakfast club
- School lunch has improved and the food is tasty - the food comes up from Llanerfyl
- Chips on Friday

- There is a lot of space here, so there is enough room for us to have time alone if necessary
- It is a healthy school and we make fruit pots
- The school is suitable for disabled children or children who have had an injury e.g. a broken leg, because there are no stairs

2. Is there anything you dislike about Ysgol Dyffryn Banw, or anything that could be better?

- No
- Have more spaces for nature, a nature corner

3. If things changed, and if Ysgol Llanerfyl pupils also came to school here in Dyffryn Banw, what impact would this have?

- We are friends with Llanerfyl children already, so there wouldn't be much of an impact on us
- Llanerfyl children come here quite a lot already, for example to see Mr Formula
- It would be good to have more sports and competitions. There are not enough children here to have a netball team at present, so there would be enough children for this
- It would be good to have more children in the school and more friends
- Llanerfyl children would have to come to school by car / on the bus
- There is room for 120 children here, so there is plenty of room for more children

4. Is there anything that worries you about the possibility that Ysgol Llanerfyl children could come to school here?

- I worry that we wouldn't be friends and that Llanerfyl children would stick together and that Dyffryn Banw children would stick together
- We would be happy for Llanerfyl children to come here - there's plenty of space here and I would be happy to welcome new children here.

5. If things changed, and if Ysgol Dyffryn Banw pupils went to school in the building in Llanerfyl with Ysgol Llanerfyl children, what impact would this have?

- I would worry about this - my mother is English and my sister wasn't allowed to go to Llanerfyl because Mum was English
- This would be good for Llanerfyl children, but there's not enough room for everyone there
- There are stairs at Ysgol Llanerfyl and I worry that if there were disabled children at the school, they would not be able to get upstairs
- There wouldn't be room for everyone in the classes
- There is no canteen or hall
- It's dangerous to cross the road to go to the hall
- There is only one female toilet at Llanerfyl, there are more toilets here

6. Is there anything that worries you about the possibility that you would have to go to school in the building in Llanerfyl?

- I don't think there's enough room for everyone
- I'm worried that people would move to Ysgol Llanfair or Ysgol Pontrobert
- I worry about crossing the road to go to the hall
- I'm worried that they don't let English children go to Llanerfyl. I would have to go to Llanfair
- It would be good for Llanerfyl children, but I don't think the change would be good for us.

7. Pupils were asked if they had any further comments or anything else to add. The following comments were made:

- Having one school is a good idea but the loss of a school in one place will affect that community
- If there were one school, it would be easier for the children to make friends and the school would be able to compete in netball and choir competitions, and be better at Eisteddfodau.
- Ysgol Llanerfyl is good at some things and Ysgol Dyffryn Banw is good at other things, so the new school would be able to be good at lots of things

To conclude the session, the officers explained the next steps in the consultation process. It was explained that the consultation will close on the 5th November, after half term, and the pupils were encouraged to send any further comments to the school transformation team, or to their teachers who will be able to arrange for them to be sent on.

ii) Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School

Officers from the School Transformation Team met with Llanerfyl School Council on 24 October 2018 to discuss the consultation on the future of Ysgol Llanerfyl and Ysgol Dyffryn Banw.

One session was held with 7 pupils from the school council, and a second session with 2 latecomers to Welsh-medium education.

The officers explained the proposals in relation to Dyffryn Banw Primary School and the Llanerfyl Church in Wales (Foundation) School, namely:

- To close Dyffryn Banw Primary School and Llanerfyl Church in Wales (Foundation) School and to establish a Welsh-medium Church in Wales Voluntary Aided School.
- To establish the new school either
 - a. On the current site of Dyffryn Banw Primary School **or**
 - b. On the current site of Llanerfyl Primary School

The pupils were asked a number of questions and their responses are summarised below:

1. What do you like about Ysgol Llanerfyl? What's good about the school?

- The food is good here
- We are all friends
- The building is big enough
- There is plenty of room here
- It's easier to be here because there aren't many children here
- The site is open after school and at weekends
- The building is old
- The building and the classrooms are colourful, and there are lots of things on the walls
- The playing field, there is plenty of space to have 4 play areas at the same time
- I like to play rounders, cooking, running, football, netball and crafts here
- Eisteddfodau and taking part in the Urdd
- The site is safe and it's safe enough to cycle and walk to school
- The teachers are kind and willing to help you
- The teachers can be strict but they help us and are kind
- Being able to walk to school
- I like the fact that it is a small school, there are friends in different year groups, and everyone knows each other

2. Is there anything you dislike about Ysgol Llanerfyl, or anything that could be better?

- Rugby, we are not allowed to tackle because it's a 'contact sport'
- There are plenty of computers in the school, but the internet is slow
- There is no hall at the school, but we use the village hall. When it rains, we use the classrooms. We use the hall for the Urdd and for concerts, and go to the Church for thanksgiving.
- It's a long way to Welshpool to buy sweets!
- Nothing, I like the school

3. If things changed, and if Ysgol Dyffryn Banw pupils also came to the school in Llanerfyl, what impact would this have?

- We don't know them very well, so we would have to get to know them
- I worry that there is less space at this school - no room in the classroom or on the playing field
- We know some of the children already through trips, playing rugby and Mr Formula
- We need to get to know the children first
- We would have to make new friends
- Llanerfyl children would show Dyffryn Banw children where to go
- We would be able to make more friends

- If the Dyffryn Banw children came here, the school would have to be made bigger
- 4. Is there anything that worries you about the possibility that Ysgol Dyffryn Banw children could come to Llanerfyl?**
- No, nothing worries us about the Dyffryn Banw children coming here
 - There would be more competition to get a place in the sports teams
 - How would 55 pupils fit in this building?
 - The only concern is that Ysgol Llanerfyl would have to be made bigger
- 5. If things changed, and if Ysgol Llanerfyl pupils went to school in the Ysgol Dyffryn Banw building with Ysgol Dyffryn Banw children, what impact would this have?**
- We would not be able to cycle to school
 - We would have to go to school by car or by bus
 - A larger minibus would be needed to take everyone to school
 - It would be harder for small children to find their way around the school because the school is bigger
 - Different teachers, it would be better if our present teachers went to Ysgol Dyffryn Banw too
 - The school is bigger and there would be more space for sports
 - Mum works at Ysgol Dyffryn Banw so that would be good
 - It would be sad for my parents and grandparents because they went to school at Llanerfyl and the school wouldn't be there any more
- 6. Is there anything that worries you about the possibility that you would have to go to Ysgol Dyffryn Banw?**
- I would have to make new friends
 - I do not want to go to Dyffryn Banw, I want to stay here
- 7. Pupils were asked if they had any further comments or anything else to add. The following comments were made:**
- We are happy in the school
 - We like the school as it is

To conclude the session, the officers explained the next steps in the consultation process. It was explained that the consultation will close on the 5th November, after half term, and the pupils were encouraged to send any further comments to the school transformation team, or to their teachers who will be able to arrange for them to be sent on.

4. CONSULTATION MEETINGS WITH STAFF AND GOVERNORS

Consultation meetings were held with the staff and governors of both schools. The issues raised at these meetings are summarised below:

i) Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School – 4th October 2018

- Would the original report that concluded that he proposed new school should be in Llanerfyl still be part of the process?
- Don't understand how one councillor was able to change the recommendation presented to Cabinet
- The governing body at Banw School approached the Council because their numbers had dropped, and Llanerfyl School is suffering because of it
- Don't know of any other example where a school with higher numbers has been closed because pupil numbers at a neighbouring schools have dropped
- Llanerfyl School doesn't want to be sacrificed to solve the problems at Banw School
- The school needs to be where the pupils are – it's not practical to move a whole school population to a school where there are very few children
- Will the decision be made based on costs?
- Question about capacity figures in the consultation document as there are different figures
- Previously there were 62 children attending Llanerfyl school and inspectors and advisors visited frequently. At no point did anyone say that there was an issue with capacity or the facilities
- If parents weren't happy with the facilities here, they would send their children elsewhere
- There has never been a capital bid for improvements to the Llanerfyl building, so the Council can't say that the facilities are poor.
- In the next step of the process, will the recommendation be made known to the Headteacher and governing body before it goes to Cabinet, as with the previous stage?
- If one school costs much more to run than the other, surely the cheaper school should win
- Queried the inclusion of information about the Estyn inspection reports in 2014 for Llanerfyl and 2016 for Dyffryn Banw in the consultation document
- Llanerfyl School received a document where the inspector commented that he hadn't seen such good standards of written or spoken Welsh in his 30 years of teaching
- Query about whether staff would start at the bottom point of the pay grade following implementation of a new staffing structure for any new school
- Query about how the temporary governing body would be formed
- What would happen if staff didn't want to apply for a post in the new school?
- Would an extension be needed to the timeline because of the amendment to the consultation made in Cabinet?

- Request for the process to be carried out as quickly as possible as this was a period of uncertainty for pupils and staff

ii) Banw C.P. School – 15th October 2018

- For the parents of Banw to move to Llanerfyl school, there would be a need for investment – the facilities are not as good there
- If the Llanerfyl site was chosen, there would be a wish list of improvements that would be needed, which would be very costly
- A number of pupils from the area attend schools outside the Banw Valley
- If the Llanerfyl children came to Banw it would be a win win situation – Banw children would have more social interaction and the Llanerfyl children would have more facilities.
- If the Banw pupils went to Llanerfyl, it would be a lose lose situation – Llanerfyl pupils would have less space individually and Banw pupils would be losing the hall and facilities
- Due to the co-location of the school with the Hall, they are entwined and rely on each other
- The Hall is a huge asset to the school because it is used so often. The school has use of it during the day, have PE lessons there and use the stage for performances. Can access it all day, and with the new curriculum it would be used even more
- Health and safety issue regarding Llanerfyl pupils walking to the Hall in all weather
- Unacceptable that in Llanerfyl PE is carried out in the classroom if it is raining
- If the decision is for Llanerfyl pupils to come to Banw, the decision will have been made for the community, not because of politics
- There would be additional costs to move boilers / services etc if Banw school shut – shutting the school would not be a simple process
- How much call would there be for a building of this size in this rural area if the building was closed?
- The Llanerfyl site has no car park, canteen, playing field or facilities, disabled access or a hall, however this is all available two miles up the road.
- The findings of the questionnaire distributed to parents during the initial engagement in the spring was that more parents believed the new school should be at Banw, even though more forms were returned from parents at Llanerfyl school than Banw school
- It is incorrect in the consultation document where it says that no pupils walk to Banw school – there is an estate directly behind the school that pupils walk from
- Concern about impartiality of the local member and her influence in the Council
- Will the local member be allowed to speak in the Cabinet meeting?
- Would the consultation potentially back Llanerfyl as they have the support of the church?
- What is the role of the scrutiny committee within this process?
- Would the council invest in a building it doesn't own?

- What would happen to the Llanerfyl building if the Council decided to close it?
- Query about the make up of the temporary governing body
- Query about the make up of the permanent governing body – would a Church in Wales governing body have more members on it? How much influence would the Church have on who sat on the governing body?
- What would it mean to be a Church in Wales school?
- Could the timescales mentioned in the consultation document be shortened?
- Why did the original recommendation change?

5. ESTYN

Estyn's response to the consultation is provided below:

Estyn response to the proposal to close Banw C.P. School and LLanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School serving the communities of the Banw Valley in North Powys and establish a new Church in Wales school in the area.

This report has been prepared by Her Majesty's Inspectors of Education and Training in Wales.

Under the terms of the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013 and its associated Code, proposers are required to send consultation documents to Estyn. However Estyn is not a body which is required to act in accordance with the Code and the Act places no statutory requirements on Estyn in respect of school organisation matters. Therefore as a body being consulted, Estyn will provide their opinion only on the overall merits of school organisation proposals.

Estyn has considered the educational aspects of the proposal and has produced the following response to the information provided by the proposer and other additional information such as data from Welsh Government and the views of the Regional Consortia which deliver school improvement services to the schools within the proposal.

Introduction

This consultation proposal is from Powys County Council and relates to the closure of Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School ("Llanerfyl C.in W. School") and to establish a new Welsh-medium Voluntary Aided Church in Wales school either on the current site of Banw C.P. School Site (*option a*) or the site of Llanerfyl C. in W. School (*option b*).

Summary/ Conclusion

It is Estyn's opinion that the proposal is likely to at least maintain standards of education in the area and offers an opportunity to ensure that Welsh medium education in the Banw Valley is sustainable.

Description and benefits

Powys County Council provides a sound rationale for the proposal:

The council sets out clearly that pupil numbers have reduced over recent years, are set to continue to decrease until 2023 and are currently at 51 over both schools in total.

Both schools are projecting to be in a deficit position by the end of the 19/20 financial year which poses a threat to the continuation of Welsh medium education in the immediate community.

Based on the information provided, the council's assertion that establishing one larger school in the Dyffryn Banw area would

- continue to provide access to Welsh-medium education
- improve opportunities for pupils by being part of a larger school
- be an efficient model for delivering primary education in the Banw areas, including reducing surplus places

appears to be reasonable.

Establishing a new Church in Wales would also ensure continued access to Welsh Medium CIW provision in the area.

The council appears to have given full consideration to the advantages and disadvantages of a wide range of available alternatives. It appears to set out credibly that

- it is not possible to federate the two schools because of their different legal status
- clustering and collaboration would not result in a single school, and would therefore not lead to a reduction in surplus places
- operating the two schools as they currently stand on two different sites would lead to limited economies of scale, not help achieve the aim of making provision in the area financially sustainable and would not address surplus places
- there are too many unknown factors and costs involved in building a new school on a new site and that this is not a viable option when there are already two buildings available.

The council has identified correctly most of the risks associated with the proposal and the two options set out within it.

It has carried out a thorough analysis of the impact on travel arrangements of both options. It establishes credibly that *option a* would increase travel times for pupils at Llanerfyl C. in W. School, leading to slightly increased transport costs for the council than *option b*. *Option a* would also mean that Llanerfyl C. in W. School pupils would no longer be able to walk or cycle to school. However, *option b* would have no impact on the ability of pupils at Banw C.P. School to walk or to school as there are currently no safe walking or cycling routes to the school. The council recognises appropriately that both *option a* and *b* may have implications for parents' travel arrangements and pupils' ability to access extra-curricular activities. It also correctly identifies that *option b* may have travel implications for parents of pupils in receipt of free school meals at Banw C.P. School as the location of the school may limit their access to it.

The council provides a clear breakdown of the capacity and condition of both buildings and appears to draw reasonable conclusions from its findings. For example, it appears to find reasonably that *option b* would provide a learning environment that is in better condition than *option a* but that *option a* would give current Llanerfyl C. in W. School pupils access to larger and a wider range of facilities, such as a dedicated dining hall and PE facilities. It also asserts reasonably and that these facilities would be withdrawn from current Banw C.P. School pupils under *option b*. From the information provided, the proposer's assertion that *option a* could provide space for the Cylch Meithrin Dyffryn Banw provision appears to be reasonable. This provision currently meets at the Llanerfyl village hall.

Whilst it is clear that both sites have sufficient capacity for pupils from both schools, this is only achievable at the Llanerfyl C. in W. School site if the Art facility is taken into account. The council has not provided sufficient detail around this aspect of the proposal to allow us to comment on the reasonableness of its decision to include it in its calculation.

The council sets out reasonably that the decision to create a new C. in W Voluntary Aided school would ensure continued access to Welsh Medium Church in Wales' provision in the area. It also asserts credibly that curricular provision would remain unchanged, with parents having the choice to opt out of collective worship or send their child to the nearest alternative community Welsh medium school. However, the council has not addressed the impact on projected numbers of pupils if future pupils do not fulfil the admissions criteria of the new C in. W school. This may also preclude siblings of pupils currently at Banw C.P. School who may want to join the school in the future, depending on the admissions criteria set by the new governing body.

Both *option a* and *b* would contribute to realising Welsh Government's strategy of achieving a million Welsh speakers by 2050

The council has also addressed appropriately a range of other identified risks, for example:

- short term risks to wellbeing of pupils
- a reduction in pupil numbers as a result of transfer
- the risk of not being able to attract a headteacher to the school

However, the council makes a reasonable case that the benefits to sustainability of Welsh medium education in the Banw Valley, and to provision, experiences and outcomes of pupils in general of the proposal outweigh the status quo. It has also identified suitable measures to mitigate this risks.

Educational aspects of the proposal

The council's presentation of the performance of the two schools is appropriate. It sets out both the categorisation of the school and the outcomes of their most recent Estyn reports. Based on the information provided, the proposer asserts credibly that stability in leadership at Banw C.P. School would suggest that standards would be at least maintained under *option a* for Banw C.P. School pupils and improved for pupils of Llanerfyl C. in W. School. However, this assertion would require that the current head teacher of Banw C.P. School remains in post in the new school or that the governors are successful in appointing a headteacher to the new school.

The suggestion that there could be some benefits to the quality of education of a larger pupil population and a slightly larger staff base is appropriate, such as the ability for teachers to specialise and provide a wider range of learning experiences. However, the reasons for the council's assertion that the physical environment at Llanerfyl C. in W. school may restrict delivery of the *new* curriculum and negatively impact delivery of that curriculum for pupils transferring from Banw C.P. School are not sufficiently clear.

Based on the information provided in the council's summary of its equality impact assessment, it seems reasonable to assume that the needs of pupils with SEN and

other vulnerable groups who move from Banw C.P. School to Llanerfyl C. in W. School, or vice versa, would not be threatened. The proposer sets out reassuringly the need to mitigate the negative effects on pupils with SEN of change through planning and by putting in place individual support plans. However, it does not consider the risks to SEN pupils if their parents choose non-denominational education in an alternative community primary school as both alternative schools could lead to increased travel times and disruption for these pupils.

6. ISSUES RAISED DURING THE CONSULTATION PERIOD

The following tables list the issues raised during the consultation period, and provides the local authority's response to these issues.

1. COMMENTS ON THE PRINCIPLE OF MERGING THE TWO SCHOOLS		
1.1 In support		
1.1.1 Improved opportunities for pupils		
1.1.1.1	Always hoped that the two schools would merge at some point as it would benefit the children	As outlined in the Consultation Document, the Council agrees that merging the two schools to establish one, larger school, would provide improved opportunities for pupils in the area.
1.1.1.2	Welcome the opportunity for positive change through combining these two small schools, enabling the children to develop a wider social sphere and to enhance the delivery of the curriculum giving them the best possible education.	
1.1.1.3	Merging the two schools would provide more opportunities for pupils if the correct site is chosen.	
1.1.1.4	Strongly believe that merging the two schools would achieve the best for the pupils – must look to the future and think about what is best for the children.	
1.1.1.5	Greater pupil numbers would give increased possibilities socially for children plus a wider range of teaching styles	
1.1.1.6	If the right decision is made it will mean a better education for children in both areas.	
1.1.1.7	Combined they could have a better resourced curriculum, wider learning experiences and a fit for purpose set of buildings	

1.1.1.8	Having all children together would give them more opportunities e.g. team games, dancing groups, choir	
1.1.1.9	One larger school may mean that years 3-6 could be separated and not taught all together in one class as currently happens in both schools	
1.1.1.10	Would mean that the pupils could make more friends	
1.1.1.11	Children from both schools would benefit i.e. more pupils engaging together in activities, taking part in eisteddfodau, making new friends	
1.1.2 More economical		
1.1.2.1	Merging the two schools will help the authority manage and fund education more effectively within the community	As outlined in the Consultation Document, both Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) are currently facing a difficult financial situation. The Council's view is that merging the two schools would help to alleviate this.
1.1.2.2	Current cost to resources would be reduced by amalgamating the two schools.	
1.1.2.3	It is not economical for 2 schools to exist within a few miles of each other with so few pupils in each.	
1.1.2.4	Financially, agree that it makes sense to merge the schools given falling numbers	
1.1.2.5	Both schools are facing serious financial challenges. Merging would help to alleviate this	
1.1.2.6	It's not fair that pupils in these schools are funded on such a high rate when pupils in other schools receive far lower funding	
1.1.3 Would safeguard provision in the area		

1.1.3.1	Strongly believe in the retention of Welsh-medium primary education in the upper Banwy valley, and agree that this is the only sustainable way of doing so.	As outlined in the Consultation Document, the Council agrees that given the current and projected pupil numbers at the two schools, merging the two schools to create one larger school would help to safeguard the provision of Welsh-medium primary education in the Banw valley.
1.1.3.2	Don't think the number of children in the valley can sustain two primary schools, so in favour of combining forces to create one more sustainable school for the area	
1.1.3.3	Creating one larger school would future proof Welsh language education in the area, pool resources and provide a vibrant, stimulating and nurturing environment for the pupils and staff.	
1.1.3.4	Support the aim of creating one resilient school which would attract parents/carers to the school rather than other schools further away, and would provide for the requirements of the new curriculum.	
1.1.3.5	Due to the low numbers and financial pressures on both schools, there will be no future for either school as they are	
1.1.3.6	The best way to ensure the provision of Welsh-medium education in the area in the future is to merge the two schools in the near future. Otherwise, there is a danger that there will be no school at all in the area.	
1.1.3.7	The only possible solution to future proof primary education in the area	
1.1.3.8	One school will hopefully be sustainable for the future	
1.1.3.9	Support merging the schools to ensure that education is kept in the valley. It would be unreasonable to educate young children further away from the valley.	

1.1.3.10	Reference to 'Together Stronger', the slogan of our national football team.	
1.1.3.11	Both schools are facing decreasing or static pupil numbers	
1.1.3.12	We need a thriving school to attract and keep the best teachers in the Banwy Valley	
1.1.3.13	Unless a decision is made now there will be no primary school in the valley. Some parents are already sending their children away from the area	
1.1.3.14	The area is lucky that the proposal is to retain one school in the area – it would still be a small school, so it would be easy for the Council to propose that the two schools need to close	
1.1.4 Reference to previous attempt to merge the schools		
1.1.4.1	For years, the area has been living under a cloud of uncertainty with regard to the future of the two schools, which is a concern for parents and has often forced them to send their children to Llanfair Caereinion Primary School or to Ysgol Meifod, an English-medium school. This situation should not exist, and to ensure the future of this community, this matter needs to be resolved.	The Council is aware of historical discussions relating to the two schools and notes these comments.
1.1.4.2	The schools should have merged 20 years ago but parent power and hysteria got in the way	
1.1.4.3	One larger school in the area is long overdue. It's time to move on and look at the bigger picture, for the benefit of future generations	
1.1.4.4	If a decision had been made two decades ago the community would be united by now, and battles of the past would be forgotten. Some parents will move their children to Pontrobert or	

	Llanfair if they don't get their way, but you need to ignore this. Hopefully the rift will heal in a decade or two	
1.2 Against		
1.2.1 Disagree with closing Ysgol Llanerfyl		
1.2.1.1	Closing Ysgol Llanerfyl is immoral	The Council does not agree with these statements. Whilst it is true that pupil numbers at Llanerfyl are higher than Banw, pupil numbers at the both schools are low, and both schools are projected to be in a deficit budget position in the coming years.
1.2.1.2	The problem is Banw school's, it would be unfair to close a school that does not have any problems	
1.2.1.3	I urge Powys Council to reconsider and leave the two schools open. Sooner or later the staff and parents at Banw will realise that it's not possible to maintain the school with so few pupils, so they will choose to close voluntarily.	
1.2.2 Reference to previous attempt to merge the schools		
1.2.2.1	Disagree with the Council's proposal to merge the two schools – we went through this around 30 years ago, this caused tension between the two communities, which continued for years afterwards	The Council notes these comments, however the Council's view is that merging the two schools is the best way forward in order to provide improved opportunities to the pupils and also to safeguard the provision of Welsh-medium primary education in the area. This is supported by the findings of the questionnaire published as part of this consultation exercise, where 83% of respondents agreed that merging the two schools was the most suitable way forward in order to safeguard the provision of Welsh-medium education in the area. It is acknowledged that any school reorganisation process leads to a period of uncertainty for the communities involved, and the Council is keen to conclude this process as swiftly as possible, in order to end this period of uncertainty.
1.2.2.2	It was the same the last time PCC wanted to close Llanerfyl and transfer the pupils to Banw. It was the same problem then – pupil numbers at Banw were decreasing and pupil numbers at Llanerfyl were increasing. After a great deal of fighting, the Council was persuaded to change its mind. However, the tension continued between the two communities, and it is only recently that the two communities have come together.	

1.2.3 The communities won't come together		
1.2.3.1	The community is split and I can't see how they will ever come together to support one or the other	It is acknowledged that any school reorganisation process leads to a period of uncertainty for the communities involved, and the Council is keen to conclude this process as swiftly as possible, in order to end this period of uncertainty. Once a decision is made on the way forward, the Council will endeavour to work with both school communities in order to establish the new school, to ensure that it meets the needs of all pupils in the area.
1.2.3.2	Ideally both schools should remain open to serve their respective communities	
1.2.3.3	This will create a divide and tension in the community, with the two areas refusing to work together	
1.2.3.4	How can the two schools merge when the governors, parents and community aren't showing any potential that they will be able to work together as one school?	
1.2.3.5	I can't see a solution that will result in the bonding of pupils, parents, staff and community. The Council's efforts to date have only led to an increase in tension for all concerned and opened old wounds from when the schools were under threat 2 decades ago	
1.3 Other		
1.3.1	Closing a school is very emotional, whichever school that may be	The Council notes this comment, and acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal leads to a period of uncertainty for the communities involved.
1.3.2	Other than cost, I would not agree that the most suitable solution is to merge as so many factors for both schools would suggest keeping both open would be sensible	The Council notes this comment, however this is not supported by the findings of the questionnaire published as part of this consultation exercise, where 83% of respondents agreed that merging the two schools was the most suitable way forward in order to safeguard the provision of Welsh-medium education in the area.

1.3.3	Wherever the school is located, adequate outdoor space will be needed, and the school's teaching resources will need to be upgraded to ensure that it is a space that inspires pupils to learn.	Comment noted. As outlined in the consultation document, once a decision is made on how to proceed, the Council will commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify the scope of the required to the building where the proposed new school is to be located.
1.3.4	With sensible investment, both buildings could be excellent options in terms of providing excellent learning and play experiences through the medium of Welsh, uniting the community and trying to stem the current flow of children to other nearby schools rather than staying in the valley.	Comment noted.

2. COMMENTS ABOUT BANW C.P. SCHOOL		
2.1 Location		
2.1.1 Positive comments		
2.1.1.1	Banw site is geographically central to the existing joint catchment, and Llanerfyl families already regularly support and use Llangadfan facilities e.g. Cann Office, Dyffryn Banw FC	The Council notes these comments regarding the central location of the Banw site to the whole catchment area currently served by Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School.
2.1.1.2	The site of Banw is more central to the area that the school would serve – the catchment area extends from the edge of Foel to Llanerfyl, including the villages of Foel, Langadfan and Llanerfyl	
2.1.1.3	Banw is more central to the pupils of both schools – should Llanerfyl be chosen, pupils would have to travel a maximum of 10+ miles each way, which seems excessive. If Banw site was chosen, pupils would have to travel a maximum of 5.85 miles each way. The difference in time and distance could have a negative impact on emotional well-being, particularly for younger children	

2.1.1.4	There is easy access off the main A458 trunk road	The Council notes these comments regarding the benefits of the location of the Banw site on the main A458 trunk road.
2.1.1.5	The location of Banw School is perfect, on the A458, and in a perfect location to promote Welsh-medium education to all that pass on their travels through mid Wales.	
2.1.2 Negative comments		
2.1.2.1	Work commitments as well as supermarkets, medical centre and other services are all in the direction of Llanfair Caereinion, Welshpool, Newtown.	The Council notes these comments, and acknowledges that should a new school be established on the Banw site, there would be an impact on parents whose children currently attend Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School
2.1.2.2	Many children attend after school activities in the other direction e.g. Llanfair Caereinion, Welshpool, Newtown, Meifod	
2.1.2.3	Having to take/collect children from school activities on the Banw site would be inconvenient for most	
2.1.2.4	A school located in Banw would only serve a handful of children, with Llanerfyl parents tempted to go to Llanfair as this is the commuting route of most parents	
2.1.2.5	The school is in a poor location, which isn't the main focus of a village	Whilst it is true that the school is not located in the centre of a village, the school is located in the middle of the area currently served by Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School and Banw C.P. School. It is also co-located with the Banw Community Hall and other community facilities, which are regularly accessed by residents across the Banw Valley.
2.1.2.6	Banw school is at the side of a busy main road which is very dangerous	It is true that the school is located at the side of a busy main road, however appropriate arrangements are in place to ensure that pupils are unable to access the main road. The main entrance to the school during school hours is from the rear of the school, not directly from the main road.

2.1.2.7	It's not possible for children to walk or cycle to school on the current Banw site due its location on a busy and dangerous main road	It is acknowledged that establishing a new school on the site currently occupied by Banw C.P. School would mean that it would be more difficult for children currently attending Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School to walk or cycle to school. However, pupils living in the housing estate adjacent to the school are currently able to walk / cycle to school, and they would continue to be able to do so. Should a new school be established on this site, the Council would investigate the possibility of establishing safe walking and cycling routes to the school.
2.1.2.8	The school does not provide safe walking and cycling routes to school as per the requirements of Active Travel (Wales) 2013.	
2.1.2.9	Concern that pupils would be unable to walk to school if the school was in Banw	
2.2 Building Condition		
2.2.1 Reference to HoWPS report		
2.2.1.1	Although the condition has been rated 'Generally Poor', there is scope to improve this provided there was budget and a plan of action in place.	The Council notes this comment. It is true that the condition of the building could be improved following investment in the building.
2.2.1.2	Examination of the HoWPS condition report shows that, of the £358,000 expenditure said to be needed in the next 18 months, approximately £212,000 is made up of two capital projects (replacing the heating boiler and associated pipework and tarmacking the playground). There would surely be a financial payback from installing a new modern heating system.	The Council notes this comment. It is true that a large proportion of the expenditure outlined as being required over the next 18 months is for replacement of the heating boiler and associated pipework, and it is true that the Council would expect this investment to lead to a reduction in running costs.
2.2.1.3	Disappointed with the findings of the HoWPS report which classifies the condition of Banw School as C – generally poor. Why has the school not been maintained to the required standard?	Approximately 43% of the Council's blocks of school accommodation are condition C and D, therefore Banw is not the only school in this condition. £58,000 of capital funding has been spent on the Banw building over the last 10 years. This included boiler and heating works and the replacement of the canteen roof. The school also has a delegated budget which covers repairs and maintenance costs,

		<p>and the school has been spending this money on maintenance of the building.</p> <p>The current condition of the school building is primarily due to the age of the building. Capital improvements to school buildings are prioritised and ranked by the Council based on building condition, therefore given the building condition, it is likely that the Council would be looking to carry out work to improve the building condition soon.</p>
2.2.2 Reference to improvements required		
2.2.2.1	With some improvements to the building condition, the site would provide a fantastic school with facilities in place to support the delivery of the new curriculum which will be of benefit to all children in the Banw Valley	<p>The Council notes these comments regarding improvements needed to the Banw C.P. School building, and would agree that some improvements are required to the building condition, as identified by the HoWPS assessment, which identified the building's condition as 'C – Generally Poor'.</p>
2.2.2.2	As a larger school, it's not surprising that maintenance costs are higher not that certain facilities need replacing after a certain time	
2.2.2.3	The school is in need of modernisation, as is the case with any building of its age, however none of the improvements required are structural – the improvements needed are windows etc.	
2.2.2.4	Some improvements are need to the Banw building e.g. the heating system, however these improvements could bring more opportunities to save in the long term	
2.2.2.5	The building is in disrepair and does not lend itself to the nurture that primary school pupils need and deserve	
2.2.3 Other		

2.2.3.1	The condition of the building at the Banw site is 'C' – with Powys wanting to close as many schools with a grading of 'C' in the foreseeable future, this gives them the perfect opportunity	<p>The Council currently has no plans to close schools with a grading of 'C' or below.</p> <p>Whilst the current School Organisation Policy states that</p> <p>'The Council aims to have an educational model which fulfils the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Has high quality learning environments, with the long term aim that all schools will be assessed as condition A or B' <p>The intention is that this would be achieved by a combination of new builds to replace the buildings in the poorest condition and investment in other buildings in order to improve their condition.</p>
2.3 Building Suitability		
2.3.1	The building has been assessed as being more suitable for curriculum delivery purposes. This was to be expected as Dyffryn Banw is a purpose built educational facility, whilst Llanerfyl is a converted house	It is true that the HoWPS report carried out in 2018 assessed the suitability of the Banw building as 'B – Generally satisfactory', whilst the suitability of the Llanerfyl building was assessed to be 'C/D – Poor to bad'.
2.3.2	The building is not primary school friendly	The Council does not agree with this statement. The Banw building has been successfully providing primary education for a number of years, and the recent assessment carried out by HoWPS assessed the building's suitability as 'B – Generally satisfactory'.
2.4 Reference to the new curriculum		
2.4.1	Dyffryn Banw is the best site when considering the requirements of 'Curriculum for Life' – a building that has appropriate space, a hall for presentations, performances, physical education,	The Council notes these comments, and agrees that the facilities on the Banw site are conducive to the requirements of the new curriculum.

	workshops and other activities. There is space within the building for groups to work independently	
2.4.2	New curriculum – children need to learn from experience, with flexibility for teachers to achieve this in creative ways which suit the learner. Sufficient space is needed to ensure that the new curriculum can be implemented fully, so that different learning areas can be set out around the classroom. There is plenty of room in Dyffryn Banw to ensure that the children have the best education which meets the requirements of the new curriculum.	
2.4.3	The Banw site and building are suitable for developing education in accordance with ‘Donaldson’ – space for developing independent learning areas	
2.4.4	Has all the facilities needed for the current curriculum and the new curriculum	
2.4.5	One of the areas of the new curriculum is ‘Expressive Arts’ – access to a hall will be essential to enable pupils to develop creative and performing skills	
2.5 The school site		
2.5.1	There is a large playing field for outdoor sports, which is also used for area sports	The Council notes these comments relating to the space and facilities available on the Banw site.
2.5.2	The Banw site has better facilities which can be upgraded to provide a modern, 21 st century school	
2.5.3	There are vegetable and flower gardens in front of the school which are developed by the pupils and the friends of the school	
2.5.4	The school / site has more space and facilities	

2.5.5	The school is purpose built to meet the needs of 72 pupils	
2.5.6	The site is fully suited to accommodating a new, merged school due to the superior facilities on offer, greater capacity and flexibility of the site and ability to contribute to a number of Powys' strategic educational objectives	
2.5.7	The site is physically better placed for increased numbers, having internal space, including a larger hall and extensive playing areas	
2.5.8	Banw's Estyn report from 2010 and 2016 refer to the benefits of the site	
2.6 Parking		
2.6.1	Ample parking facilities for school buses and parents/carers, and plenty of room to accommodate more	The Council notes these comments relating to the parking space available on the Banw site, which can also be accessed by buses.
2.6.2	There is a large car park at the front of the school and a small car park to the rear which is usually used by staff	
2.6.3	There is a large car park at the front which is used for collection and drop off by parents on school days, and for other community group activities out of school hours	
2.6.4	Buses can easily access the parking area when needed	
2.6.5	There is plenty of space for buses and minibuses in the large car park, with no danger of risk for the children	
2.6.6	The gate to the large parking area is locked during the day so no one can enter it	Comment noted.

2.6.7	The school has a car park policy in place to ensure the safety of children at pick up and drop off times	Comment noted.
2.7 Size		
2.7.1	Large enough to easily accommodate the current total number of pupils but also any local children who are currently taken to schools outside the catchment. Could also accommodate local pre-school/nursery services on site	The Council notes these comments about the site's size, and agrees that the Banw site could accommodate the current number of pupils in the area.
2.7.2	Can easily accommodate pupils from both schools without compromising on personal space and impacting on pupil well-being, but could also accommodate more should the number of children wishing to come to the school increase in the future.	
2.8 Classroom configuration		
2.8.1	Classrooms are spacious and airy	The Council notes these comments relating to the classrooms and facilities available at Banw C.P. School.
2.8.2	Classrooms are connected by a corridor so there is no disruptive through traffic	
2.8.3	Covered outdoor classroom for the foundation phase to access as required	
2.8.4	The building could easily be adapted to accommodate four classes, to establish an ICT area, a STEM area, and there is plenty of space to develop expressive arts	
2.8.5	The Foundation Phase class offers plenty of room to create a range of areas, ensuring that this includes a computer area, building equipment, sand, water, a create area, creative painting, which are all available daily	

2.8.6	Large windows which make the classrooms nice and bright, with access to the outdoor area which is fenced for safety	
2.8.7	There is access to a committee room which is used for music lessons among other things – peripatetic teachers can teach here without disturbing the other classes	
2.9 Toilets / Changing Facilities		
2.9.1	There are changing rooms and toilets for boys and girls at either end of the school	The Council notes these comments about the toilet / changing facilities at Banw School.
2.9.2	The number of toilets meet the toilet:pupil ratios – no more toilets would need to be provided if the site was in Llangadfan	
2.9.3	There are separate changing areas for boys and girls at opposite ends of the school	
2.10 Kitchen / Dining Facilities		
2.10.1	The kitchen is bigger and seems in a better condition than Llanerfyl	The Council notes these comments about the kitchen / dining facilities at Banw School.
2.10.2	There is dining space which is separate to the classrooms	
2.10.3	The canteen area provides the opportunity to have a breakfast club – a positive for parents who go to work, and enables the children to have a balanced meal which leads to the children being more focused at the beginning of the school day	
2.10.4	Ysgol Dyffryn Banw has a brand new kitchen but is unable to attract a cook – meals are prepared at Llanerfyl for both schools and are transported to Banw	When the previous cook at Ysgol Dyffryn Banw left in September 2017, Powys Catering reviewed the uptake of school meals at Ysgol Dyffryn Banw. The outcome of this review was that the uptake wasn't sufficient to warrant a

		permanent cook on site at Banw, and the decision was made to export meals from Llanerfyl to Banw.
2.11 Hall		
2.11.1 Facilities available at the hall		
2.11.1.1	There is a large hall attached to the school which has its own separate kitchen, toilet etc.	The Council notes these comments relating to the facilities available to the school at the adjoining community hall.
2.11.1.2	There are excellent gymnastics facilities in the hall	
2.11.1.3	The adjacent hall has expensive PE equipment which can be used for PE	
2.11.2 The school's access to / use of the hall		
2.11.2.1	The school has exclusive use of the hall in term time and in school hours	The Council notes these comments about the school's access to the adjoining community hall.
2.11.2.2	The hall is a huge asset to the school because it is used so often. The school has use of the hall during the day. PE lessons are held there, and the stage is used for performances. The school can access it all day, and with the new curriculum it would be used even more.	
2.11.2.3	What are the arrangements between the community hall and the school – how much does the school pay for the hall?	There is an agreement in place between the school and the community hall. The school pays an annual fixed sum to the community hall of approximately £2500 per year for unlimited use of the hall during school hours (until 4.30pm) throughout the school year.
2.11.2.4	In reality how often does the School in Banw actually use the hall?	The school makes extensive use of the hall and committee room throughout the week for a range of activities. This includes all physical education lessons (except when these

2.11.2.5	The hall seems to be Banw's selling point, it would be interesting to see how often it is actually used by the school, as opposed to the community	take place outdoors), instrumental lessons, concerts, workshops, services, mediation, use of the stage for performance rehearsals. The hall is also used for 'milltir y dydd' in bad weather.
2.11.3 Other queries relating to the hall		
2.11.3.1	Is the hall heating system separate to the school?	The hall heating system is separate to the school's – heating can be put on in the hall without the heating having to be on in the school. The heating for the committee room is on the same system as the school's heating, however storage heaters have recently been installed in the committee room, which means that heating can now be provided in this room without having to heat the whole school.
2.12 Reference to links between the school and the community		
2.12.1	Because the site incorporates a Community Centre, it is already a community hub, which all the advantages that brings	The Council notes these comments relating to links between the school and the community
2.12.2	Estyn report in 2016 referred to the school's strong partnership with the local community. This reflects the aim of 'developing our schools to be organisations that are central to community activity', which is outlined in the Cabinet's new School Organisation Policy.	
2.13 Disabled Access		
2.13.1	Banw School is all on one level, therefore could easily accommodate children/teachers with mobility issues	The Council notes these comments. Whilst it is true that the school is on one level, should a pupil with additional physical needs wish to attend the school, a full review would need to be carried out, and it is likely that additional facilities would need to be provided.
2.13.2	Whilst the site would need some adaptations to accommodate physically challenged pupils, it would be easier to adapt this site due to the layout being over 1 floor and the door and corridor openings being wider	

2.13.3	There is a toilet suitable for pupils in a wheelchair or that have disabilities	
2.14 Safeguarding		
2.14.1	Safeguarding concerns about the school being attached to the hall. One mistake not to set an alarm or lock a door would mean that a child's life would be ruined	The only times the hall is used during school hours is for elections and for funeral teas. In all situations such as these, the door between the hall and the school is locked by the headteacher or in her absence, a teacher who is responsible for the school in her absence. A Safeguarding Policy is in place which outlines these arrangements, and a Safeguarding Audit is carried out annually. Apart from when being used for elections of funeral teas, the external door to the hall is locked, therefore members of the public would be unable to access the hall.
2.14.2	Safeguarding concerns about attachment to the Hall	
2.14.3	The doors between the hall are locked when the hall or committee room is being used by the public during school hours to safeguard the children	Comment noted.
2.15 Opportunities to develop the site		
2.15.1	Provides an opportunity to create a centre of excellence for the Welsh language	The Council notes the suggestions for further developing the Banw site to provide additional facilities for the community.
2.15.2	Early years provision could be part of the school – there are adequate areas to include 'Cylch' and 'Ti a Fi', which will enable parents of younger children to transition from one to the other with ease – this could be in one building.	
2.15.3	Banw site could be an integrated children's centre – this would benefit the wider community and be in line with Welsh Government policy	

2.15.4	The Banw site has lots to offer in terms of developing education in the area	
2.15.5	There is an opportunity to make more community use of the building by potentially introducing on-site nursery care, after school clubs, community clubs, adult learning facilities, sports clubs	
2.15.6	Would be possible for the Cylch Meithrin to be integrated within the school on the Dyffryn Banw site – would be ideal for all children’s services to be housed at one location, this site can easily accommodate this	
2.15.7	Has all the facilities necessary to become a model community school – on site catering facilities, community hall, community play area, ability to accommodate a nursery, playing fields, ample parking and safe access from a major road.	
2.15.8	If the future of the Welsh language in the Banw Valley is a major concern, then the Banw site provides the space and facilities to offer a centre, including Cylch Ti a Fi, Ysgol Feithrin, Nursery, Infant, Juniors, Parent and Child Welsh courses, Welsh community activities, which would attract more families to the area and would protect, extend and sustain the Welsh language in the area long term.	
2.15.9	From the main village to Ysgol Dyffryn Banw there is a potential to make a cycle track / walking route through the field alongside the river, to provide a car free route to school and the football pitch.	
2.15.10	An extension could be added if needed as the grounds around the school are vast and owned by the Council	

2.15.11	The surrounding land is in the Council's ownership, which would make for flexibility in respect of adjusting to new challenges	
2.16 Possible alternative uses should there be no school on the site		
2.16.1	<p>Unclear what possible alternative uses would be viable for the building and/or site:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The size, layout and design could be appropriate for some sort of commercial use, however there is no demand for office or retail space in the area - Village workshops are an option, but this provision already exists in Llanerfyl and is not used to capacity - Industrial unit would be inappropriate given the close proximity to residential properties - Demolition and re-development for housing is an option, but not likely to be viable: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Llangadfan is classed as a small village in the Powys LDP therefore only small scale affordable housing would be considered appropriate o Demolition costs and generally low market values and rents would mean that no private developer would be interested in the site because the profit margins are so low o Complexity of having the community hall on site makes it difficult to develop o Play area at the front of the site would need to be retained for use by the Community. Its removal would be resisted by local residents and Council planners because it represents the loss of a community facility, which is contrary to Powys Local Plan policy DM11 	<p>The Council notes these comments and acknowledges the complexities relating to alternative uses for the building currently occupied by Banw C.P. School due to its location and the fact that the school is co-located with the community hall and other community facilities. This is acknowledged on page 33 of the consultation document – ‘Sale of the Banw site could be difficult due to the co-location of the community centre’.</p>
2.16.2	Likely to be difficult to identify an alternative use for the site should there be no school here, therefore likely that the site	The Council notes this comment and the reference to Beguildy School.

	would remain empty for years (similar to Beguildy). It then ultimately becomes a liability for the Council rather than a disposable asset.	The Council acknowledges that there could be issues with identifying alternative uses for the site should there be no school in the building currently occupied by Banw C.P. School, and did acknowledge on page 33 of the Consultation Document relating to this proposal that 'Sale of the Banw site could be difficult due to the co-location of the community centre'.
2.16.3	If the Council were to be successful in disposing of the Banw site, the capital receipt is likely to be minimal due to the complexities outlined, therefore it is not really a positive as the consultation document suggests.	The Council notes this comment. Whilst the Council did refer to the 'Potential capital receipt to the authority from sale of the Banw C.P. School building' on page 33 of the consultation document, the Council also acknowledges that 'sale of the Banw site could be difficult due to the co-location of the community centre'.
2.17 Other		
2.17.1	Concern about Ysgol Dyffryn Banw statistics on bullying – Estyn Report 2016, only 94% of children felt bullying was taken seriously vs 100% of children felt that Ysgol Llanerfyl dealt with bullying to their satisfaction	It is true that Ysgol Dyffryn Banw's Estyn Report from 2016 states that only 94% of children agreed with the statement that 'The school deals well with any bullying'. However only 17 pupils responded to the learner questionnaire, therefore only one pupil disagreed with this statement. The questionnaire also provides a benchmark figure, which illustrates the total responses received since September 2010. The benchmark provided for this question is 92%, therefore the percentage of 94% is above this benchmark.
2.17.2	The school provides lots of opportunities for pupils to take part in PE – this is supported by Estyn findings – from the pupils questionnaire in 2016 as stated in the Estyn Report – 'There are lots of chances at school for me to get regular exercise' – 100% agree. Compared with Llanerfyl inspection in 2014, 21% agree, 79% disagree.	The Council notes these comments regarding opportunities for pupils at Banw C.P. School to take part in PE.

2.17.3	Should Llanerfyl children move to the Banw site, the facilities would be considerably improved from what they currently have	The Council notes this comment, which supports the Council's statement on page 20 of the consultation document that: 'The current site of Banw C.P. School has been assessed to be more suitable than the current site of Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School. In particular, there is access to a hall on site, as well as more extensive facilities than those available at Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School. Implementation of this option would mean that all pupils in the Banw Valley would be able to benefit from these facilities.'
2.17.4	Don't like the building due to smelly corridors	The Council has no evidence that the building has 'smelly corridors'.
2.17.5	Because of the links between the school and the community hall, there would be additional costs to move boilers / services etc if Banw school shut – shutting the school would not be a simple process.	Comment noted.

3. COMMENTS ABOUT LLANERFYL C. IN W. (FOUNDATION) SCHOOL		
3.1 Location		
3.1.1	Access to Llanerfyl School is down a 'B' road, therefore it is away from the busy main trunk road which passes the Banw site.	The Council notes these comments regarding the location of Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School away from the main road.
3.1.2	The Llanerfyl location is safer as the road only borders a relatively small area at the front of the school, whilst a road borders the front and back of the Banw site.	
3.1.3	The school's location is safe and away from an extremely busy and dangerous road	

3.1.4	Llanerfyl School has been criticised for being down a narrow lane, however in fact there is enough room for 2 lorries to pass on this narrow lane. The main entrance to Banw School is signposted down a narrow lane.	The Council notes this comment, and acknowledges that the 'narrow lane' referred to in the consultation document is a B road. The Council also notes that the entrance to Banw School is down a narrow lane, although there is also direct access to the school from the A458.
3.1.5	The school's location down a 'B' road means that it is safe for children to walk and cycle to school and at the end of the day they can walk/cycle from the school to the village hall car park to meet their siblings from the high school bus	The Council notes this comment, and acknowledges that the location of Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School means that children living in Llanerfyl can walk or cycle to school.
3.1.6	Due to the school's location, children have the opportunity to walk and enjoy the great outdoors as most children have the benefit of living within walking distance to the school.	
3.1.7	Llanerfyl is the most central of the two schools, as the children already come from different directions	Comment noted.
3.1.8	Llanerfyl parents already have a choice of alternative schools down the valley which are more accessible than Banw. The only choices available to Banw parents are Dinas Mawddwy (11 miles), Pontrobert (9.9 miles) or to go past Llanerfyl to Llanfair Caereinion (7.8 miles)	Comment noted.
3.1.9	Parents already travel with their children to Llanerfyl to attend the Cylch Meithrin in Llanerfyl Village Hall, and they have been doing so for 45+ years	The Council notes this comment. It is true that parents / children from across the Dyffryn Banw area attend Cylch Meithrin Dyffryn Banw, which is held in Llanerfyl Village Hall.
3.2 Building Condition		
3.2.1	The building has been assessed to be in better condition than Banw's building	It is true that the HoWPS report carried out in 2018 assessed the condition of the Llanerfyl building as 'B – Generally satisfactory' whilst the condition of the Banw building was assessed to be 'C – Generally poor'.

3.2.2	Although small, the school was/is frequently cold	Whilst the HoWPS report carried out in 2018 identified some issues with the school's heating system, these were taken into consideration in the overall assessment of the building's condition as 'B – Generally satisfactory'.
3.3 Building Suitability		
3.3.1	Suitability is assessed as 'poor to bad' based on current pupil numbers, surely this would be further negatively impacted with an increase in pupil numbers?	<p>The Council notes these comments regarding the suitability of the Llanerfyl building to accommodate a new school to serve the Banw Valley area. It is true that the HoWPS report carried out in 2018 assessed the suitability of the building as 'C/D – Poor to bad'. As stated on page 10 of the consultation document, 'This assessment is based on the perceived limitation of having no hall, and the significant limitations due to conversion and extension of the original property.'</p> <p>Should the Council proceed with the establishment of a new school on the Llanerfyl site, it is acknowledged that steps would need to be taken to address the suitability. As outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document:</p> <p>'Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken to address any issues relating to the building's suitability, in order to ensure that the quality of accommodation is at least as good as the current provision:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify the scope of the work required - Dependent on the scale of the work required, the Council will consider what would be the appropriate funding source for this work. As the building is not owned by the Council, discussions would need to take place with the Priscilla Foster Trust.'
3.3.2	There are no plans to convert or extend Llanerfyl school before the schools merge, so the 'poor to bad' score would remain.	
3.3.3	There is no potential to change the 'suitability' rating as there is no land available to purchase or to extend onto	
3.3.4	No complaints about Llanerfyl School as a building, however would question its suitability as a school	
3.3.5	The building is not fit for purpose	
3.3.6	Llanerfyl site currently does not offer compatible facilities to provide for the requirements of a modern 21 st century school	
3.3.7	The current number of pupils can only just be accommodated adequately, as there is very little room for movement other than the classrooms themselves and a small communal entrance / conservatory area. Any more children would surely be falling over each other causing friction and also health and safety issues as there is no fire escape from upstairs	
3.3.8	Although Llanerfyl school has served generations of the community for many years and is a very functional school, I do feel that to move on and give the local children the best	

	resources needed within their school life, Llanerfyl doesn't tick as many boxes	
3.3.9	A new parents coming to the area would take one look at Llanerfyl and send their children elsewhere	
3.3.10	For the parents of Banw to move to Llanerfyl school, there would be a need for investment – the facilities are not as good there	
3.3.11	If the Llanerfyl site was chosen, there would be a wish list of improvements that would be needed, which would be very costly	
3.3.12	Could not readily accommodate any additional primary children from within or outside the catchment area	As indicated on page 32 of the consultation document, the Council has recalculated the capacity of Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School, with the inclusion of the Art room as a class base. This gives a pupil places capacity of 59 + 5 nursery. There are currently 51 pupils at the two schools, however the latest pupil projection information suggest that the total will decrease to 43 by January 2023.
3.3.13	Would require a lot more investment to bring the site anywhere near the standard of Banw	Whilst it is acknowledged that the Llanerfyl building does not have some of the facilities available at the Banw building, the quality of accommodation at Llanerfyl has been assessed by HoWPS to be of better quality than the accommodation at Banw C.P. School.
3.3.14	The school would be unsuitable to accommodate the merged school due to its small size, absence of important facilities and the inflexibility of the existing building and site.	The Council notes these comments regarding the suitability of the Llanerfyl building to accommodate a new school to serve the Banw Valley area. It is true that the HoWPS report carried out in 2018 assessed the suitability of the building as 'C/D – Poor to bad'. As stated on page 10 of the consultation document, 'This assessment is based on the perceived limitation of having no hall, and the significant limitations due to conversion and extension of the original property'.

		<p>However, as identified on page 32 of the consultation document, the Council has re-calculated the school's capacity in accordance with Welsh Government Circular 21/2011 'Measuring the Capacity of Schools in Wales' with the inclusion of the Art room as a class base. This calculation identified a pupil places capacity of 59 + 5 nursery, which is sufficient to accommodate all pupils currently attending the two schools.</p> <p>Should the Council proceed with the establishment of a new school on the Llanerfyl site, it is acknowledged that steps would need to be taken to address the suitability. As outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document:</p> <p>'Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken to address any issues relating to the building's suitability, in order to ensure that the quality of accommodation is at least as good as the current provision:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify the scope of the work required - Dependent on the scale of the work required, the Council will consider what would be the appropriate funding source for this work. As the building is not owned by the Council, discussions would need to take place with the Priscilla Foster Trust.'
3.3.15	Llanerfyl is homely, welcoming and cosy, but it is not capable of providing the best and most effective education for the children of the area	<p>The Council notes this comment. Should the Council proceed with the establishment of a new school on the Llanerfyl site, it is acknowledged that steps would need to be taken to address the suitability. As outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document:</p> <p>'Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken</p>

		<p>to address any issues relating to the building's suitability, in order to ensure that the quality of accommodation is at least as good as the current provision:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify the scope of the work required - Dependent on the scale of the work required, the Council will consider what would be the appropriate funding source for this work. As the building is not owned by the Council, discussions would need to take place with the Priscilla Foster Trust.'
3.3.16	If parents were not happy with the facilities available at the school they would simply move their children either to Banw or to an alternative school. However pupil numbers remain constant – it is the school with supposedly better facilities where pupil numbers are declining	The Council notes this comment, however the information provided in the Consultation Document shows that pupil numbers at Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School have decreased over the last few years, from a maximum number of 51 in 2012 to the current number of 32.
3.3.17	Previously there were 62 children attending Llanerfyl School and inspectors and advisors visited frequently. At no point did anyone say that there was an issue with capacity or with the facilities.	The current capacity of Llanerfyl School based on current use of the accommodation is 44 + 5 nursery, as indicated on page 51 of the consultation document. The Council has also carried out an updated capacity calculation in accordance with Welsh Government Circular 21/2011 'Measuring the Capacity of Schools in Wales', based on including the Art room as a class base. This provides a capacity of 59 + 5 nursery.
3.3.18	There has never been a capital bid for improvements to the Llanerfyl building, so the Council can't say that the facilities are poor.	<p>With regard to the facilities at the school, the Council commissioned HOWPS to carry out an updated condition and suitability assessment of the two schools. As indicated on page 10 of the consultation document, the suitability assessment provided for Llanerfyl School was C/D – Poor to bad. This was based on 'the perceived limitation of having no hall, and the significant limitations due to conversion and extension of the original property.'</p>

3.3.19	From the consultation document, it seems that the only issue with Llanerfyl is the facilities – however this is not an issue for us as parents, and if it was we would send out children elsewhere	Comment noted.
3.3.20	Llanerfyl site with a few improvements to toilets, kitchen could work as a stop gap for the next few years, until Welsh-medium education in the Banw Valley becomes untenable.	Comment noted.
3.4 The School Site		
3.4.1	Does not seem to have land available to extend without compromising the outdoor space	The Council notes these comments regarding the facilities and space available at Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School
3.4.2	The outdoor playing area in Llanerfyl is much smaller than Banw	
3.4.3	Although there is a playing field in Llanerfyl, it does not offer the same facilities to children as the one in Dyffryn Banw	
3.4.4	The surrounding land is in private ownership	It is true that the land surrounding Llanerfyl C. in W. School is privately owned.
3.5 Parking		
3.5.1 Reference to the adequacy of the amount of parking facilities at the school		
3.5.1.1	The parking at Llanerfyl School is limited	It is acknowledged that parking space at Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School is limited. Should a decision be made to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the Council would need to look at ways to address this. There is pavement along the road from the Village Hall, therefore one possibility could be to encourage parents to park at the Village Hall and walk along the pavement to the school.
3.5.1.2	The school does not currently have capacity for parents to drop off / pick up children or to park whilst attending school events if pupil numbers were to increase	
3.5.1.3	It's chaos at pick up time with cars everywhere – this would only get worse if there were more pupils	

3.5.1.4	There are car parking spaces for approx. 10 cars, most of which will be taken by teaching staff. Parents would need to park on the side of the road and collect their children.	It is acknowledged that parking space at Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School is limited and that some parents drop off and collect children outside the school gates. Whilst this is not ideal, there is pavement along the road to the school, therefore there is a safe route for parents to walk with their children to school should they need to park outside the school site. Should a decision be made to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the Council would need to look at ways to address this. There is a pavement along the road from the Village Hall, therefore one possibility could be to encourage parents to park at the Village Hall and walk along the pavement to the school.
3.5.1.5	Parents drop off and pick up children outside the school gates which is not ideal	
3.5.16	There is adequate parking at the school, especially as the majority of pupils walk to school	Comment noted.
3.5.2 Health and safety concerns related to the parking arrangements		
3.5.2.1	Parking is available on the road, however this is a public road which is used by cars, large tractors, school buses, timber and livestock lorries	These comments regarding the use of the road outside the school are noted. All schools should have a traffic management plan in place, which should address any hazards posed by the road outside the school. Should a new school be established on the Llanerfyl site, the new school would be expected to put a traffic management plan in place, which would take account of the number of pupils attending the new school.
3.5.2.2	Log wagons, large tractors and trailers use the road outside the school throughout the day, this is a safety hazard	
3.5.2.3	Aware that risk assessments would be done in relation to the parking situation, however there has already been one accident this year on the bridge	The school's traffic management plan would be expected to refer to any high risk areas, and to provide information about how to deal with that situation.
3.5.2.4	The parking arrangements mean that it is not always possible to ensure the health and safety of pupils	
3.5.3 Buses are unable to access the school site		

3.5.3.1	Buses have to reverse up the narrow road by the side of the school to get to the safest place, which is still on the main road – there are houses up this road too, and the bus blocks the road to them	The Council notes this comment regarding difficulties with buses accessing the school site.
3.6 Classroom Configuration		
3.6.1	The configuration is awkward and there is no circulation space – rooms open onto other rooms	The Council notes these comments regarding the configuration of the building.
3.6.2	Children have to walk through another classroom to go to the toilet – this would lead to disruption of another class of pupils.	
3.6.3	Configuration of the space must make teaching difficult	
3.6.4	Apart from the conservatory area, the classrooms are small and cramped and have very little natural light	The Council notes this comment regarding the classrooms at Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School.
3.6.5	There is no covered outdoor classroom for the foundation phase to access	The Council acknowledges that the current foundation phase classroom at Llanerfyl does not meet the design guidance. For example, there is no external covered canopy for outdoor education. Should the Council proceed with the establishment of a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken, as outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document: 'Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken to address any issues relating to the building's suitability, in order to ensure that the quality of accommodation is at least as good as the current provision: - Commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify
3.6.6	Foundation phase pupils are taught in the entrance lobby where there are large conservatory style windows – this must be unbearable in the sunshine	
3.6.7	The foundation phase class is too small to offer the range of activities which is offered in Banw	

		<p>the scope of the work required</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Dependent on the scale of the work required, the Council will consider what would be the appropriate funding source for this work. As the building is not owned by the Council, discussions would need to take place with the Priscilla Foster Trust.'
3.6.8	There is no opportunity for pupils to get away from their workspace, particularly on wet days, as they work, eat, play (on wet days), and do all other activities in the same room – this cannot be good for their emotional well-being.	<p>The Council acknowledges that this is not ideal.</p> <p>Should the Council proceed with the establishment of a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken, as outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document:</p>
3.6.9	If it's raining pupils don't leave their classroom as there is nowhere for them to go	<p>'Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken to address any issues relating to the building's suitability, in order to ensure that the quality of accommodation is at least as good as the current provision:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify the scope of the work required - Dependent on the scale of the work required, the Council will consider what would be the appropriate funding source for this work. As the building is not owned by the Council, discussions would need to take place with the Priscilla Foster Trust.'
3.7 Reference to the new curriculum		
3.7.1	New curriculum – children need to learn from experience, with flexibility for teachers to achieve this in creative ways which suit the learner, sufficient space is needed to ensure that the new curriculum can be implemented fully so that different learning areas can be set out around the classroom. There is no room for this in Llanerfyl	<p>The Council acknowledges that the Llanerfyl building could pose challenges in terms of implementation of the new curriculum – as stated on page 37 of the consultation document:</p> <p>'The Llanerfyl building is smaller than the Banw building, and</p>

		this, coupled with the reduced facilities available, could impact negatively on the new school's ability to provide appropriate learning experiences for pupils, particularly given the requirements of the new curriculum.'
3.7.2	One of the areas of the new curriculum is 'Expressive Arts' – access to a hall will be essential to enable pupils to develop creative and performing skills	
3.7.3	The configuration will cause challenges for the new curriculum, as more square meters will be needed per child	
3.8 Toilets / Changing Facilities		
3.8.1 Toilet facilities		
3.8.1.1	Legally, pupils over 5 years have to have 1 toilet for every 20 pupils. In Llanerfyl there is one boys toilet (and urinal) and 2 girls toilets – one of which was out of order.	The current number of toilets at Llanerfyl C. in W. School, including the out of order toilet which would be repaired and put back into operational use, is sufficient for the current number of pupils attending the school.
3.8.1.2	Don't think the toilet facilities would be sufficient to accommodate more children	
3.8.1.3	Concerned about maintaining hygiene standards with regard to the toilets due to the high volume of use for the minimal facilities	Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the Council would need to check the suitability and sufficiency of the toilet provision across the age ranges, as part of the steps outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document.
3.8.1.4	The toilet areas are open and next to each other – lacking in privacy.	
3.8.1.5	The toilets are back to back with hardly any privacy	The Council acknowledges that the current toilet arrangements at Llanerfyl C. in W. School are not ideal for Key Stage 2 pupils over 8 years old. Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the Council would need to consider the suitability and sufficiency of the toilet provision across the age ranges, as part of the steps outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document.
3.8.1.6	The coat peg area and toilets for boys and girls are next to each other with no door for privacy – would only need to look around a corner and you could see the boys at the urinals	
3.8.2 Changing facilities		

3.8.2.1	Lack of separate changing areas to provide privacy for girls and boys	These comments regarding the lack of separate changing areas at Llanerfyl C. in W. School are noted. Most Powys primary schools do not have separate changing areas, and the provision of changing rooms is not included within Building Bulletin 99, the design guidelines for primary schools.
3.8.2.2	Unclear whether changing facilities exist	
3.8.2.3	Pupils have to change for PE in the classrooms	
3.9 Kitchen / Dining Facilities		
3.9.1 Reference to dining arrangements		
3.9.1.1	Pupils eat at their desks – this is far from ideal	It is acknowledged that pupils eating lunch at their desks is not ideal, and that this is a situation which requires managing by school staff. However, Llanerfyl is not the only school in Powys where this is the case.
3.9.1.2	Pupils eat at their desks, which means that they must clear work away before dinner and set up again after dinner – this wastes learning time	
3.9.1.3	I don't think eating in the classroom meets the council's own guidelines	
3.9.1.4	Eating in the classroom does not meet the requirements of the 21 st Century Schools Programme or 'Building Bulletin 99'.	It is acknowledged that a separate dining area would be required in order to meet the design guidance for primary schools. However, Llanerfyl is not the only school in Powys where pupils eat in the classroom.
3.9.1.5	It's detrimental to pupil well-being that they do not have a break from the classroom	It is acknowledged that it is not ideal that pupils don't have a break from the classroom, however the Council is not aware of any evidence to suggest that this is detrimental to their well-being.
3.9.1.6	Although there is no law governing children eating at their desks, I feel that this is detrimental to their emotional well-being as they are still at their 'work station' – children need a break from their desks	

3.9.1.7	Hygiene issues with food that must fall onto the carpeted floor when pupils are dining in the classroom	The Council acknowledges this concern. Schools are responsible for the replacement of floor coverings, therefore if replacement flooring was needed, this would be a matter for the school.
3.9.1.8	The dining situation at Llanerfyl works well	The Council notes these positive comments regarding the dining arrangements at Llanerfyl.
3.9.1.9	Mealtimes is by way of silver service, this teaches the children to lay the tables and then serve the food before they all sit down together to enjoy their lunch	
3.9.1.10	The school embraces the family model at lunchtimes. This has been found to be beneficial in teaching children about responsibilities and helping younger children with their meals. Research has shown that this model works very successfully, especially in deprived areas of London for example.	
3.9.1.11	Llanerfyl is not the only school in the county without a canteen, so this must be viewed proportionally	
3.9.1.12	The lack of canteen has never been an issue for Llanerfyl pupils, and this is not the only school in Powys that does not have a canteen	Whilst it is not ideal that pupils eat their lunch in the classroom rather than in a separate canteen, it is acknowledged that Llanerfyl isn't the only school where this happens.
3.9.1.13	Llanerfyl pupils are not disadvantaged by a lack of a canteen, and this should not form any basis for decision making.	
3.9.1.14	The perceived issue with not having a canteen has never been raised as a problem before. Never has a capital bid been placed from Powys County Council to make allowances for a canteen.	
3.9.1.15	If a separate dining area was needed, adaptations could be made to the conservatory area to provide this	
		The Council notes this comment. Should a decision be made to proceed with establishing a new school on the Llanerfyl site, consideration would need to be given to what work was needed

		to address any issues relating to the building's suitability, which could include adaptations such as these.
3.9.2 Reference to the kitchen		
3.9.2.1	The kitchen is considerably smaller than Banw's and in inferior condition	The Council acknowledges that the kitchen at Llanerfyl is smaller than the kitchen at Banw. Both schools received 5 out of 5 in their latest Food Hygiene rating, carried out in Banw C.P. School on the 7 th December 2017 and Llanerfyl C. in W. School on the 23 rd January 2018.
3.9.2.2	The pantry is a cupboard, and the door can't fully open due to space issues	
3.9.2.3	Would request reassurance that the kitchen facilities have recently been assessed to the standards required. Any improvements needed would need to be factored into the overall decision	
		<p>Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School received 5 out of 5 in its latest Food Hygiene rating, carried out on the 23rd January 2018.</p> <p>Two minor issues were identified, which were as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) The painted wall covering in the rear storeroom was flaking. Renew or repair the wall covering and leave in a sound, easy-to-clean condition. (<i>Regulation (EC) No. 852/2004, Annex II, Chapter II, para.1(b)</i>). ii) The whisk in the kitchen drawer was rusted and cannot be adequately cleaned. Replace the whisk. (<i>Regulation (EC) No. 852/2004, Annex II, Chapter V, para.1(c)</i>).
3.10 Hall		
3.10.1 Reference to pupils accessing the village hall		
3.10.1.1	There is no hall on site – pupils have to walk along the road for indoor PE, concerts etc.	The Council notes these comments regarding the lack of a hall on the Llanerfyl site. However, as noted on page 37 of the consultation document: 'Whilst there is no access to a hall on the current Llanerfyl site, there is a village hall in Llanerfyl, which is located a short
3.10.1.2	The school has the use of the village hall which is within walking distance of the school	

3.10.1.3	The children have a safe walk to the village hall whenever they need to use it	distance away from the school, and which is used by the school.'
3.10.1.4	Do not agree that the lack of a hall on site is a disadvantage – the school has access to the village hall within a 5 minute walk, and there is a safe walking route along the way	Whilst it would be desirable for all schools to have a hall on site, it is acknowledged that there are other schools in Powys which don't have a hall immediately adjoining the school. The Council identified on page 37 of the consultation document that: 'Whilst there is no access to a hall on the current Llanerfyl site, there is a village hall in Llanerfyl, which is located a short distance away from the school, and which is used by the school.'
3.10.1.5	Pupils enjoy the short walk to the local village hall which is used regularly and to attend Church Services	Comment noted.
3.10.1.6	The village hall pupils walk to isn't suitable for PE as tables and chairs are stored within the hall – this is dangerous	If there are tables and chairs stored in the hall, this would need to be taken into account when determining what activities to undertake, and where these activities would take place. Whilst it is acknowledged that this is not ideal, it is also acknowledged that as the village hall is not part of the school, this is something over which the school has no control.
3.10.2 Concern about the walk to the village hall		
3.10.2.1	Walking to the hall reduces learning time and also increases risk to the children's safety due to the need to walk along a public road	Whilst it is acknowledged that access to a hall on site would be more desirable than having to walk to access the village hall, there is pavement along the road from the school to the village hall. This would be covered by a risk assessment, and would take place under managed circumstances with staff supervision. Should a new school be established on the Llanerfyl site, the new school would need to complete a new risk assessment, to take account of the number of pupils attending the new school.
3.10.2.2	Concern about children walking along the road to the hall – the road is used by the farming community throughout the day, therefore there are heavy vehicles with limited visibility travelling both ways at any given time	

3.10.3 Reference to PE		
3.10.3.1	Pupils sometimes do PE in their classroom as there is no hall on site – however, this doesn't give enough space, and wouldn't work if there were more pupils attending the site	The Council would agree that the classrooms in Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School are unsuitable to be used for physical education lessons.
3.10.3.2	Whilst there is a field and yard which are suitable for physical education, the classes are totally inappropriate for this during bad weather	
3.10.3.3	Lack of a good sized separate indoor space for children to do PE and to play on wet/cold days causes concern for the children's health and well-being	The Council would agree that it is not ideal that there is no separate indoor space on site for children to do PE and to play on wet/cold days, however Llanerfyl is not the only school in Powys where this is the case. The Council is not aware of any evidence that this is detrimental to pupils' health and well-being.
3.10.3.4	In the pupils questionnaire in Llanerfyl's Estyn inspection in 2014, only 21% of pupils agreed that 'There are lots of chances at school for me to get regular exercise'. This is in contrast with Banw's Estyn inspection in 2016, where 100% of pupils agreed with this statement.	Comment noted. However, it must be recognised that the number of pupils involved was small – 24 Llanerfyl pupils responded to the questionnaire, with 5 of these agreeing with the statement.
3.10.4 The school's ability to access the village hall		
3.10.4.1	Although there is access to a hall, the Cylch Meithrin use it during the week, so there isn't an opportunity to use it every day	It is true that the Cylch Meithrin use the hall on Wednesday mornings, Monday, Tuesday and Thursday afternoons. However, the hall is available to the school to use throughout the remainder of the week.
3.10.4.2	Although there is access to the village hall which is 400m away, use of the hall involves pre-booking.	The hall is available to the school throughout the school week, apart from the times when the Cylch Meithrin are using it. The school has a good relationship with the village hall and the need to 'pre-book' the hall does not cause any difficulty – use of the hall is planned in advance, so there is no problem with making the necessary arrangements to use the hall.

3.10.5 Queries about why the lack of a hall hasn't been raised as an issue previously		
3.10.5.1	If the lack of a hall immediately adjoining the school is considered an issue, why has the education authority not flagged this up before?	Whilst it would be desirable for all schools to have a hall on site, it is acknowledged that there are other schools in Powys which don't have a hall immediately adjoining the school. The lack of a hall immediately adjoining Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School is not the reason for the proposal to merge the two schools and establish a new school on one of the two current sites.
3.10.5.2	There is no evidence that not having a hall has had any detrimental effect on the outcome of past pupils and their sporting and cultural achievements suggest that any such evidence would be difficult to provide	
3.10.5.3	If a hall is a fundamental requirement, Powys has failed the children of Llanerfyl in not providing this historically	
3.10.6 Other		
3.10.6.1	The school pays only for its use of the hall, therefore does not have to bear the continuous cost of maintenance and heating. This is in contrast to the community hall used by Banw, which I believe is on the same heating system as the school, billing wise	<p>Whilst it is true that Banw C.P. School is on the same heating system as the community hall, arrangements are in place to ensure that the community hall pays for its own heating.</p> <p>In respect of oil and water, the school pays for the oil and water used, and the Council invoices the Hall for their use based on the following locally agreed percentages:</p> <p>Oil: School 56% Hall 44%</p> <p>Water: School 67% Hall 33%</p> <p>In respect of electric, the school pays for the electric, and the community hall is billed for its actual usage based on readings from a separate meter.</p>

		<p>The heating for the hall can be turned on without having to turn on the heating for the school. In addition, storage heaters have recently been installed in the committee room and the toilet in the community hall, so there is now no need to turn on the heating in the school for any events that take place in the hall outside school hours.</p>
3.10.6.2	<p>Should the Llanerfyl site be chosen, there would be no provision for a school hall to be built, therefore Banw children would be moving to a site with inferior facilities – this is not putting the well-being of children first.</p>	<p>As noted on page 37 of the consultation document:</p> <p>‘Whilst there is no access to a hall on the current Llanerfyl site, there is a village hall in Llanerfyl, which is located a short distance away from the school, and which is used by the school.’</p>
3.10.6.3	<p>If the school is located in Llanerfyl it must be on the condition that an on-site sports hall is constructed, but I struggle to see how one could be accommodated at the site</p>	<p>Whilst it would be desirable for all schools to have a hall on site, it is acknowledged that there are other schools in Powys which don’t have a hall immediately adjoining the school. The Council identified on page 37 of the consultation document that:</p> <p>‘Whilst there is no access to a hall on the current Llanerfyl site, there is a village hall in Llanerfyl, which is located a short distance away from the school, and which is used by the school.’</p> <p>Should the Council proceed with the establishment of a new school on the Llanerfyl site, it is acknowledged that steps would need to be taken to address the suitability. As outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document:</p> <p>‘Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken to address any issues relating to the building’s suitability, in order to ensure that the quality of accommodation is at least as good as the current provision:</p>

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify the scope of the work required - Dependent on the scale of the work required, the Council will consider what would be the appropriate funding source for this work. As the building is not owned by the Council, discussions would need to take place with the Priscilla Foster Trust.'
3.11 Community Use / Links		
3.11.1 Reference to the school's role in the community		
3.11.1.1	The school is the hub of the village and has the support of the whole community	The Council notes the comments about the important role of Llanerfyl School in the community, and acknowledges that closure of any school has an impact on the community in which the school is located.
3.11.1.2	The role of the wider community is very important in Llanerfyl School – parents, grandparents, siblings, children and cousins of current and former staff and pupils, all of whom still feel a connection to the school. A highly motivated, socially conscious group of people that support the school and the wider community. We volunteer and form the backbone of local sports teams e.g. Llanfair Hockey Club, Dyffryn Banw FC, COBRA Rugby Club, and local community organisations such as Cylch Meithrin, Sant Erfyl Church, Bethel and Pentyrch Chapels	
3.11.1.3	All the school's events are well supported as well as the entertainment activities organised by a strong Friends of the school committee.	
3.11.1.4	Second and third generations of families attend the school, this shows the importance of the school to the community	
3.11.1.5	The Friends of the School at Llanerfyl are active in buying practical equipment such as book bags, school bags and arranging inclusive meetings and activities	
		The Council acknowledges the support provided to the school by the Friends of the School.

3.11.2 The school building is not a focus for the community		
3.11.2.1	The building does not serve the community as Banw school obviously does	The Council notes these comments and acknowledges that the Llanerfyl building is not as extensively used by the community as the Banw building, due to the extensive use made of the Banw Community Hall by a range of organisations.
3.11.2.2	Would be very difficult to increase the scope of community benefits / offerings to match what Banw provides to the community	
3.12 Disabled Access		
3.12.1	Classroom arrangements for physically challenged children wanting to attend the school would be limited as wheelchair bound pupils would be confined to the ground floor.	It is true that the school is set over 2 floors, and does not currently provided disabled access. Should a pupil with additional physical needs wish to attend the school, a full review would need to be carried out, and it is likely that additional facilities would need to be provided.
3.12.2	Designed as a house so is set over 2 floors – issues re disabled access.	
3.13 Health and Safety queries		
3.13.1	How would fire regulations stand should there be a significant number of extra pupils at the school?	Should the Council proceed with establishing a new school on the Llanerfyl site, a revised Fire Risk Assessment would be carried out based on the new number of pupils attending, and any shortcomings identified would be addressed.
3.14 Opportunities to Develop the Site		
3.14.1	Whilst Llanerfyl could be extended to accommodate any increase in pupil numbers, concerns about where and how, and whether additional land could be purchased.	As indicated on page 32 of the consultation document, the Council has carried out an updated capacity assessment of Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School which includes the Art room as a class base. This provides a capacity figure of 59 + Nursery, which is sufficient to accommodate all current and projected pupils.
3.14.2	The school runs through a river course, which would need to be taken into account if considering developing / extending the site.	

		<p>Should the Council proceed with the establishment of a new school on the Llanerfyl site, it is acknowledged that steps would need to be taken to address the suitability. As outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document:</p> <p>‘Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken to address any issues relating to the building’s suitability, in order to ensure that the quality of accommodation is at least as good as the current provision:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify the scope of the work required - Dependent on the scale of the work required, the Council will consider what would be the appropriate funding source for this work. As the building is not owned by the Council, discussions would need to take place with the Priscilla Foster Trust’ <p>This work would also need to consider whether additional land was available and issues relating to the river.</p>
3.14.3	No opportunity to accommodate local pre-school/nursery services on the site	This is identified on page 34 of the Consultation Document as a disadvantage of the proposal to establish a new school on the current site of Llanerfyl C. in W. School – one of the disadvantages listed is ‘Currently there is nowhere to accommodate Cylch Meithrin / early years provision on the site.
3.14.4	New hard flooring is to be laid in the classroom, which will ensure that it is multi-functional and making full use of its facilities.	Comment noted.
3.15 Possible alternative uses should there be no school on the site		

3.15.1	The building is owned by the Priscilla Foster Trust, so could be handed back to the trust	The building occupied by Llanerfyl School is owned by the Priscilla Foster Trust, not the Council. Should the building no longer be required for educational purposes, it would be handed back to the Trust, who would determine its future use.
3.15.2	Should there be no school in this building, it would not be the Council's responsibility to find an alternative viable use for the building	
3.15.3	The building could easily be converted to a single residential dwelling in the same way that many chapels in the area have been converted.	
3.15.4	Perhaps Llanerfyl School could be used as a community business or hub	
3.15.5	What would happen to the Llanerfyl building if the Council decided to close it?	
3.15.6	Llanerfyl School is located in a much smaller building than Banw, and on a site which is in a less prominent location off a minor road. Should it be difficult to identify an alternative use for the building, the building would be less visible than the Banw building.	Comment noted.
3.16 Successes of Ysgol Llanerfyl		
3.16.1	Llanerfyl School is renowned for its successes on the playing fields having had particular success at the Urdd football tournament, and in the last 5 years reaching the finals in Aberystwyth. Pupils have successfully competed in a range of sports competitions, and pupils have gone on to represent Newtown and Shrewsbury academies in football, Central Wales football, Rygbi Gogledd Cymru South, represented North Wales in hockey – therefore there cannot be any issues with the playing fields and facilities at Llanerfyl	The Council acknowledges the previous successes of Ysgol Llanerfyl. However, as outlined in the Consultation Document, pupil numbers in the Banw Valley have reduced over recent years, and the Council is keen to identify a solution which will ensure that excellent educational opportunities continue to be provided to pupils in the area in the future.

3.16.2	Llanerfyl School received a document where the inspector commented that he hadn't seen such good standards of written or spoken Welsh in his 30 years of teaching, however this is not included in the consultation document	The information with regard to quality of provision which is included in the Consultation Document is the same for both schools, in order to enable comparison. As required by the School Organisation Code (2013), information on the outcome of each school's most recent Estyn inspection is provided, as well as information from the latest school categorisation exercise.
--------	--	--

4. CATEGORY OF ANY NEW SCHOOL		
4.1 Church in Wales categorisation		
4.1.1 Reference to current categorisation of Llanerfyl as a Church in Wales School		
4.1.1.1	Llanerfyl is a Church in Wales school and this ethos plays an important part within the school.	The Council notes these comments regarding the current status of Llanerfyl School as a Church in Wales school and the positive impact this has on the pupils. The Council's proposal is to establish a new Church in Wales school, to ensure that pupils in the area can continue to benefit from these elements.
4.1.1.2	Llanerfyl pupils enjoy the links with the church and being able to walk to the church to worship as part of their school life	
4.1.1.3	As a Church in Wales School, Llanerfyl offers a safe, friendly and family environment in which children can learn and develop. The school's aims, objectives and values include celebrating the rich heritage of faith and its ethos on respecting equality	
4.1.1.4	Llanerfyl School has a strong connection with the church and this tradition should continue	
4.1.1.5	Pupil numbers at Llanerfyl reflect parent satisfaction with regard to being a Church in Wales school	
4.1.2 Support for establishing a new Church in Wales School		

4.1.2.1	It has been acknowledged that schools with a religious character play an invaluable role as first class providers within the system, providing an approach to education that helps to make an increasingly diverse Wales, a more tolerant nation characterised by justice and prosperity (Faith in Education document)	The Council notes these comments, which support the current proposal to establish a new Church in Wales school.
4.1.2.2	Important to maintain our faith schools as they provide a unique ethos	
4.1.2.3	The most important thing is that there is a school in the area. If this means it has to be a Church in Wales School, then this would be the best action to take	
4.1.2.4	Feel that this is the only way to join the two schools	
4.1.2.5	As Ysgol Llanerfyl is already a C in W School, it would be appropriate for the new school to be in this category too	
4.1.2.6	It's acceptable that the new school is a Church in Wales school as Ysgol Llanerfyl already has links with the church. However, it's important that it is a community school for the whole area	<p>The Council notes this comment, and agrees that it is important that the school serves the whole area, regardless of whether or not it is a Church in Wales school.</p> <p>As a Voluntary Aided school, the governing body would be the admissions authority, responsible for the admissions policy and oversubscription criteria. The criteria would need to reflect the trust deed which refers to providing education for the local children.</p>
4.1.2.7	This is acceptable if the church contributes financially towards the school	The Diocese of St Asaph actively supports and resources its 51 Church schools. The school would have access to the services of the Diocesan Education team (in addition to Powys County Council), who can provide advice and support on curriculum, buildings, repair and maintenance, admissions and ethos matters, and who provide regular training and resources for staff. The school would have access to a network of advisers

		<p>and consultants commissioned by the Diocese, and would also have access to training, resources and activities.</p> <p>They would have a named ‘Bishop’s Visitor’, who would support and challenge the school; embodying the pastoral concern that the Bishop of St Asaph has for the schools in his diocese.</p> <p>As a Voluntary Aided School, capital repairs and maintenance funding would be apportioned to the school through the Diocese, who receive a grant allocation from the Welsh Government.</p>
<p>4.1.3 Disagree with establishing a new Church in Wales School</p>		
<p>4.1.3.1</p>	<p>As I understand, very little funding support is provided by the Church in Wales, so on this ground I see no benefit of remaining one</p>	<p>The Diocese of St Asaph actively supports and resources its 51 Church schools. The school would have access to the services of the Diocesan Education team (in addition to Powys County Council), who can provide advice and support on curriculum, buildings, repair and maintenance, admissions and ethos matters, and who provide regular training and resources for staff. The school would have access to a network of advisers and consultants commissioned by the Diocese, and would also have access to training, resources and activities.</p> <p>They would have a named ‘Bishop’s Visitor’, who would support and challenge the school; embodying the pastoral concern that the Bishop of St Asaph has for the schools in his diocese.</p> <p>The Welsh Government provide funding on an annual basis to cover the governor responsibility for the external envelope of the school at a rate of 85%. This is through the Capital Repairs and Maintenance Programme which is managed by the Diocese. All Diocese of St Asaph Voluntary Aided schools can apply for this funding, which is applied according to need.</p>

		<p>As a Voluntary Aided school any potential funding through the 21st Century Schools Programme would be at a rate of 85% Welsh Government grant aid. The Council can also help with the 15% governor responsibility.</p> <p>The local authority is responsible for repair and maintenance to the internal part of the school.</p> <p>The Diocese also supports buildings investment through capital receipts of redundant sites.</p>
4.1.3.2	Religion does not have anything to do with schooling except as an educational topic	Church in Wales schools seek to provide the highest possible standards of education within a distinctively Christian context, that allows every child to reach their full potential.
4.1.3.3	I don't agree with Church Schools. Religion should be taught, but I don't think schools should sponsor one religion over another	The curriculum in a Church school requires pupils to explore, appreciate and understand a wide range of different religions, beliefs and perspectives, ensuring that pupils learn tolerance and respect for those of all faiths and none.
4.1.3.4	There are currently no benefits to being a Church in Wales school	<p>Church in Wales schools seek to provide the highest possible standards of education within a distinctively Christian context, that allows every child to reach their full potential.</p> <p>The curriculum in a Church school requires pupils to explore, appreciate and understand a wide range of different religions, beliefs and perspectives, ensuring that pupils learn tolerance and respect for those of all faiths and none.</p> <p>The school would have access to the support and services of the Diocesan Education team (in addition to Powys County Council), who can provide advice and support on curriculum and ethos matters, and who provide regular training for staff. The school would have access to a network of advisers and</p>

		<p>consultants commissioned by the Diocese, and would also have access to training, resources and activities.</p> <p>They would have a named 'Bishop's Visitor', who would support and challenge the school, embodying the pastoral concern that the Bishop of St Asaph has for the schools in his diocese.</p> <p>As a Voluntary Aided School, capital repairs and maintenance funding can be applied for.</p>
4.1.3.5	Would prefer a community primary school	Comment noted.
4.1.3.6	Don't think any religious body should be involved in education unless it is via an entirely privately funded model e.g. no council funding is provided	Comment noted.
4.1.3.7	Don't know the significance of a school being associated with a particular religion. Tend to think that education should include learning about all religions impartially	<p>A Church in Wales school teaches about other religious beliefs and points of view as well as Anglican Christianity. A church school does not measure its success criteria by pupils adhering to Christianity, but seeks to equip its pupils with the knowledge and understanding for them to critically evaluate the moral and ethical challenges of life and find their own response; be that within Christianity or not. The aim of a church school is to give a gift of broad education, allowing children to make an informed decision.</p>
4.1.3.8	Don't believe the Church should have any input. Most of the parents in both schools are non-believers and have never entered a Church in their life	
4.1.3.9	Don't know why the school should be a church school as very few parents or pupils attend church regularly in Llanerfyl or Garthbeibio	
4.1.3.10	No religious body should oversee education. Schools should be community schools, accepting pupils of all creeds, races and colour	
<p>4.1.4 No preference with regard to whether or not the new school is a Church in Wales school</p> <p>/</p>		

4.1.4.1	I understand that there is little difference between a church school and a community school	Church in Wales schools seek to provide the highest possible standards of education within a distinctively Christian context, allowing every child to reach their full potential. The curriculum in a Church school requires pupils to explore, appreciate and understand a wide range of different religions, beliefs and perspectives, ensuring that pupils learn tolerance and respect for those of all faiths and none. The ethos and distinctiveness of a Church school equips learners to appreciate and understand different cultures and faiths with Christian values and ethos at the heart of all it does.
4.1.4.2	No strong opinions on this issue either way	Comment noted.
4.1.4.3	The schools coming together is more important than whether it is a C in W School or not	Comment noted.
4.1.4.4	The site of the school is more important than whether or not it is a Church in Wales School	Comment noted.
4.1.5 Concern about establishing a Church in Wales School on the Banw site		
4.1.5.1	Should the school be sited at Banw, the children would not be able to walk to the Church or Chapel as they can now	The Christian ethos of the school would be maintained regardless of the site, through support from the Diocese and the Section 50 inspection process.
4.1.5.2	Should a Church in Wales school be established in Banw, there would be an additional transportation cost to bring the children down to practices and services at the Church in Llanerfyl	The Section 50 inspection will address each key question, using the following evaluation statements as a guide:
4.1.5.3	Do not believe the same religious ethos could be maintained in Banw. Pupils would not be able to walk to the church or chapel in Llanerfyl, which is an important part of school life. A hall can be built at Llanerfyl School, but it would be impossible to build a church with walking links to Banw school.	How well does the school, through its distinctive Christian character, meet the needs of all learners? Rationale: Pupils should be achieving their full potential in our church schools. Maximising learning is paramount. Learners have

4.1.5.4	<p>Human Rights Act makes reference to the rights of parents to have their religious and philosophical beliefs respected during their children’s education. Moving the school away from Llanerfyl would go against this act as it would sever links not only with the Santes Erfyl Church but also Bethel Chapel – closure of the school would result in religious discrimination and a breach of the human rights act. Ysgol Dyffryn Banw site does not provide these important religious links</p>	<p>academic, personal and spiritual needs, all of which should be addressed in a loving environment where distinctively Christian values and teaching are encountered.</p> <p>Inspectors must evaluate:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • how well the Christian character contributes to the academic achievement, personal development and wellbeing of all learners, regardless of their ability or background • how effectively the Christian character supports the spiritual, moral, social and cultural (SMSC) development of all learners whether they are Christian, of other faiths, or of none • how effectively the distinctively Christian character shapes the relationships between all members of the school community • how well the Christian character promotes an understanding of contemporary Wales and respect for diverse communities • the contribution of religious education to the Christian character of the school. <p>Wherever the school is sited it will be important to strengthen the relationship between the school and the Church. The Governing Body will be a key partner with the vicar, church committee, parents, staff, Mission area conference and the Diocesan education team to embed and strengthen the relationship between the Church and the school.</p>
<p>4.1.6 Financial queries related to Church in Wales designation</p>		
4.1.6.1	<p>Understand the potential funding advantages of Church in Wales designation, but have also been informed by the local county councillor that voluntary aided schools are exempt from</p>	<p>Voluntary Aided schools are exempt charities for the purposes of the Charities Act 1993 and therefore automatically qualify for 80% mandatory rates relief.</p>

	<p>paying business rates. Neither Powys nor Church in Wales officers could confirm this at the drop-in event.</p>	<p>They may qualify for relief of up to 100% at the discretion of the local authority.</p>
<p>4.1.6.2</p>	<p>Would the Church in Wales contribute to running and maintaining the school?</p>	<p>Responsibility for the provision, repair and maintenance of a Voluntary Aided School is shared between the school governors and the LA. The Governors are responsible for the external fabric of the school. The LA is responsible for the repair and maintenance and for the initial provision of the kitchen, dining hall, medical inspection room, caretaker's house and playing fields.</p> <p>Under paragraph 5 of Schedule 3 of the School Standards and Framework Act 1998, the Welsh Government has the power to grant aid up to 85% of the costs of the governors approved expenditure, with the governors themselves required to meet the remaining 15%.</p> <p>The Welsh Government provide funding on an annual basis to cover the governor responsibility for the external envelope of the school at a rate of 85%. This is through the Capital Repairs and Maintenance Programme which is managed by the Diocese. All Diocese of St Asaph Voluntary Aided schools can apply for this funding which is applied according to need.</p> <p>As a Voluntary Aided school any potential funding through the 21st Century Schools Programme would be at a rate of 85% Welsh Government grant aid. The Council can also help with the 15% governor responsibility.</p> <p>The LA is responsible for repair and maintenance to the internal part of the school.</p> <p>The Diocese of St Asaph provides resourcing for its schools in a variety of ways through access to expert advisors, training, resources and capital investment where resources can be</p>

		reallocated and invested. The Diocese does not receive direct grant or public funds but supports its schools through its own fundraising and income generation.
4.1.7 Other queries		
4.1.7.1	Have no objection to the new school being 'Church in Wales', however my preference would be for the school to be owned and run by Powys Council	Comment noted.
4.1.7.2	It's important that the school is a Welsh-medium school, doesn't necessarily need to be a Church of Wales School	Comment noted.
4.1.7.3	Can a CP become a Church in Wales School?	<p>The Council is not proposing that a CP school becomes a Church in Wales School, the Council is proposing to close the two current schools, and to establish a new Church in Wales School on one of the two current sites.</p> <p>It would be possible to establish a new Church in Wales School on the site currently occupied by Banw C.P. School, however this would require the Council to transfer interest in the Banw site to the Diocese, where it would be held in a charitable trust.</p>
4.2 Voluntary Aided Church in Wales categorisation		
4.2.1 Support for establishing a school of this category		
4.2.1.1	No objection to the merged school being Voluntary Aided Church in Wales if this is the easiest / cheapest way to continue Welsh-medium primary education in the area	Comment noted.
4.2.1.2	An advantage to being a Voluntary Aided Church in Wales school is that pupils can start at 4 years of age, which acclimatises them to school life before year one starts	The Governing Body of a Voluntary Aided school determines its admissions at statutory school age, and it is true that many schools provide early entitlement provision to enhance their offer.

4.2.1.3	The school would have access to increased funding by being a VA Church in Wales School	<p>The Welsh Government provides funding on an annual basis to cover the governor responsibility for the external envelope of the school at a rate of 85%. This is through the Capital Repairs and Maintenance Programme which is managed by the Diocese. All Diocese of St Asaph Voluntary Aided schools can apply for this funding which is applied according to need.</p> <p>As a Voluntary Aided school any potential funding through the 21st Century Schools Programme would be at a rate of 85% Welsh Government grant aid. The council can also help with the 15% governor responsibility.</p> <p>The LA is responsible for repair and maintenance to the internal part of the school.</p>
4.2.1.4	No objection to this, as the only different as far as I can see is the school's current ability to amend the admissions policy.	Comment noted.
4.2.2 Disagree with establishing a school of this category		
4.2.2.1	It doesn't need to be voluntary aided, just Church in Wales	To be a denominational Church in Wales school the statutory category has to be either Voluntary Aided or Voluntary Controlled.
4.2.3 Queries about this category		
4.2.3.1	Document does not make it clear why the new school should be a voluntary aided Church in Wales School. My preference would be for it to be a CP school	Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School is the only Welsh-medium Church in Wales primary school in Powys. Should any new school established in the Banw Valley not be a Church in Wales primary school, the nearest alternative Church in Wales provision would be Castle Caereinion Church in Wales School (VC), which is an English-medium primary school. The nearest alternative Welsh-medium Church in Wales provision would be at Rhayader C. in W. School or Ysgol Trefonnen, Llandrindod

		<p>Wells, both of which are dual stream schools. The Council is proposing to establish a new Voluntary Aided Church in Wales School in order to continue to provide access to Welsh-medium Church in Wales provision.</p>
4.2.3.2	<p>Don't understand what this category means, or what sort of education this would give the children. Also, what would be the balance and the level of co-operation between the Church in Wales and Powys County Council with regard to funding, the curriculum, monitoring and support etc</p>	<p>In a Voluntary Aided School</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The governing body employs staff and decides admission arrangements • The land and buildings are normally owned by a charitable foundation • The governing body contributes to building and maintenance costs (through the Capital Repair and Maintenance Programme which is managed by the Diocese) • The governing body will have a majority of foundation governors <p>Church in Wales schools seek to provide the highest possible standards of education within a distinctively Christian context that allows every child to reach their full potential. The curriculum in a Church school requires pupils to explore, appreciate and understand a wide range of different religions, beliefs and perspectives, ensuring that pupils learn tolerance and respect for those of all faiths and none. The ethos and distinctiveness of a Church school equips learners to appreciate and understand different cultures and faiths with Christian values and ethos at the heart of all it does.</p> <p>The school would follow the denominational syllabus for RE.</p> <p>The school would have Estyn inspections as any other CP school, and would also have a Section 50 inspection which would address each key question, using the following evaluation statements as a guide:</p>

		<p>How well does the school, through its distinctive Christian character, meet the needs of all learners?</p> <p>Rationale: Pupils should be achieving their full potential in our church schools. Maximising learning is paramount. Learners have academic, personal and spiritual needs, all of which should be addressed in a loving environment where distinctively Christian values and teaching are encountered.</p> <p>Inspectors must evaluate:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • how well the Christian character contributes to the academic achievement, personal development and wellbeing of all learners, regardless of their ability or background • how effectively the Christian character supports the spiritual, moral, social and cultural (SMSC) development of all learners whether they are Christian, of other faiths, or of none • how effectively the distinctively Christian character shapes the relationships between all members of the school community • how well the Christian character promotes an understanding of contemporary Wales and respect for diverse communities • the contribution of religious education to the Christian character of the school. <p>The Diocese of St Asaph and Powys County Council will work closely with regard to funding, the curriculum, monitoring and support.</p> <p>The Welsh Government provide funding on an annual basis to cover the governor responsibility for the external envelope of</p>
--	--	--

		<p>the school at a rate of 85%. This is through the Capital Repairs and Maintenance Programme which is managed by the Diocese. All Diocese of St Asaph Voluntary Aided schools can apply for this funding which is applied according to need.</p> <p>As a Voluntary Aided school any potential funding through the 21st Century Schools Programme would be at a rate of 85% Welsh Government grant aid. The council can also help with the 15% governor responsibility.</p> <p>The LA is responsible for repair and maintenance to the internal part of the school.</p>
4.2.3.3	<p>Would this mean that governors from the church would be the majority on the governing body and not parents? The church in the Banw Valley are continuing to weaken, there are very few services, with an average of 3-5 attending on Sundays. By now, bilingual or English services are held and the members are very elderly. Of course the diocese and wider Caereinion area would support, but this should be secondary compared with input from parents and people in the school's natural catchment area</p>	<p>Governors are the largest voluntary body in the country. They provide a valuable service to the community and help to influence the work of schools and the future of young people. Foundation governors are important members of governing body teams in church schools with a specific responsibility in terms of monitoring and developing the Christian distinctiveness of our church schools as well as a concern for standards.</p> <p>In the Diocese of St Asaph there are two types of foundation governors apart from the ex officio: those elected by the Mission Area Conference (MAC) of the attached parish; and those appointed by the Diocesan Board of Statutory Education (DBSE), generally based on the nomination of the local clergy or MAC.</p> <p>The Mission Area will encompass a number of Church Schools and it is preferable where possible for Foundation Governors to be rooted in or have a close affinity with the worshipping community linked to the school. If this is not possible then the MAC should look to the wider Mission Area to find the candidates with the required skills, enthusiasm and</p>

		<p>experience.</p> <p>Governing bodies have overall responsibility for schools and their core functions are:</p> <p>(a) ensuring that the vision, ethos and strategic direction of the school are clearly defined; (b) ensuring that the head teacher performs his or her responsibilities for the educational performance of the school; and (c) ensuring the sound, proper and effective use of the school's financial resources.</p> <p>The foundation governor has the additional responsibility of ensuring that the Christian foundation of the school is preserved and developed.</p> <p>A Voluntary Aided school will have such number of foundation governors as will lead to their outnumbering the other governors by two. This gives the school a larger governing body, to help and support the headteacher and school.</p>
4.2.3.4	What are the benefits of the category 'Voluntary Aided Church in Wales' for a new school?	<p>The Diocese of St Asaph actively supports and resources its 51 Church schools. The school would have access to the services of the Diocesan Education team (in addition to PCC), who can provide advice and support on curriculum, buildings, repair and maintenance, admissions, and ethos matters, and who provide regular training and resources for staff. The school would have access to a network of advisers and consultants commissioned by the Diocese, and would also have access to training, resources and activities.</p> <p>They would have a named 'Bishop's Visitor', who would support and challenge the school; embodying the pastoral concern that the Bishop of St Asaph has for the schools in his diocese.</p>

		<p>As a Voluntary Aided School, capital repairs and maintenance funding will be apportioned to the school through the Diocese who receive grant allocation from Welsh Government.</p> <p>A Voluntary Aided school will have such number of foundation governors as will lead to their outnumbering the other governors by two. This gives the school a larger governing body to help and support the headteacher and school.</p>
4.2.3.5	<p>What would be the make up of the permanent governing body? How much influence would the Church have on who sat on the governing body?</p>	<p>The governing body would have exactly the same amount of community governors, parents governors etc as they usually would, but they would also need to have at least as many Foundation governors, so that they would have a bigger amount of governors.</p> <p>The Foundation Governors would need to be agreed and recommended by the Diocese. They don't have to be members of a Church in Wales, it could be people from a non-conformist background, but it's important that they are able to ensure that the Christian ethos is promoted through the school.</p>
4.3 Other categories		
4.3.1	<p>As long as a new school is created which is willing and able to accept children of all faiths and be sensitive to their needs, the category does not matter</p>	<p>Church in Wales schools seek to provide the highest possible standards of education within a distinctively Christian context. That allows every child to reach their full potential. The curriculum in a Church school requires pupils to explore, appreciate and understand a wide range of different religions, beliefs and perspectives. We ensure that pupils learn tolerance and respect for those of all faiths and none. The ethos and distinctiveness of a Church school equips learners to appreciate and understand different cultures and faiths with Christian values and ethos at the heart of all it does.</p>

		A church school does not measure its success criteria by pupils adhering to Christianity, but seeks to equip its pupils with the knowledge and understanding for them to critically evaluate the moral and ethical challenges of life and find their own response; be that within Christianity or not. The aim of a church school is to give a gift of broad education allowing the children to make an informed decision.
4.3.2	Community primary would also be a suitable category	Comment noted.

5. IMPACT ON PUPILS		
5.1 Additional travel		
5.1.1	Travel distance would increase for some pupils	The Council acknowledges in the consultation document that there would be an increase in travel for some pupils, regardless of where the new school was located. However, the Council's view is that the additional distance is not significant. In addition, there is already significant travel around the Dyffryn Banw area to access facilities across the area, therefore parents and pupils are already used to travelling around the area.
5.1.2	Should the school be in Llanerfyl, the furthest travel distance would be 10.01 miles. However, should the school be in Dyffryn Banw, the furthest travel distance would be 5.85 miles.	The Council acknowledges that the furthest travel distance for pupils would be greater should a new school be located in Llanerfyl.
5.1.3	An increase in travel distance for pupils would also impact on parents – particularly parents of pupils with health issues that need to go into school at lunchtimes	The Council acknowledges that establishing one new school in either location would impact on pupils currently attending the other school and their parents.
5.1.4	The majority of Banw pupils are already transported to school, therefore they are used to travelling by bus/car – an extra few miles will not be as significant for these pupils	The Council acknowledges on page 35 of the consultation document that if a new school was established on the current Llanerfyl site, 'Additional home to school transport would also be required for pupils currently attending Banw C.P. School. A

		number of pupils that currently attend Banw C.P. School already access home to school transport, therefore the additional distance is likely to have a minimal impact.'
5.1.5	A few miles extra travel a day will not be a problem. Parents take their children across the county almost daily to different evening activities and think little of it.	Comment noted. The Council identified in the Consultation Document that the additional travel for pupils that would be required in order to achieve either option would be minimal, and therefore the additional travel was unlikely to have a significant impact on pupils.
5.1.6	Over 50% of present and future pupils live within walking distance of Llanerfyl school. Transferring these to the Banw site would be costly	<p>The Council identified in the Consultation Document that 'Pupils living in Llanerfyl are able to walk to the current Llanerfyl building. Should the option to establish a new school in the current Banw C.P. School building be implemented, these pupils would no longer be able to walk to school'.</p> <p>The Consultation Document also includes an estimate of the impact of implementation of each option on school transport costs, which takes into account the impact of each option on the total cost of home to school transport in the Banw Valley, which includes transport to Caereinion High School and NPTC College. This estimates that both options would result in an increase in the daily cost of home to school transport from the current cost of £546.02 per day to approximately £730 per day.</p>
5.1.7	Only a very limited number of children would be able to walk/cycle to a school located in Banw compared with the number able to do this in Llanerfyl – reference to Active Travel (Wales) Act 2013. Benefits of walking to school are well documented – children who walk or cycle to school are more alert and ready to learn than those who arrive by car. Sustrans Cymru has stated that 'Active travel to school needs to be recognised and promoted as an effective and equitable way of young people increasing their physical activity levels and reducing levels of childhood obesity across Wales	The Council notes this reference to the Active Travel (Wales) Act 2013, the comments by Sustrans Cymru and the comments about the benefits of walking to school.

5.1.8	Whichever site is chosen, Council spending should be put in place to provide safe walking/cycling routes from the main village centres (including Foel) to the chosen site, reducing car usage and encouraging physical activity both for school children and the wider community	Comment noted.
5.2 Impact on vulnerable pupils		
5.2.1		The current proposal is to close both schools and to open a new school on one of the current sites. Whilst the comment is noted, the written feedback collated after the engagement with parents held in February does not include any discriminatory comments about any children from ethnic minorities.
5.2.2 5.2.3		<p>The current proposal is to close both schools and to open a new school on one of the current sites. The draft Equalities Impact Assessment produced as part of the consultation documentation identifies that there may be pupils belonging to an ethnic group other than White British at Llanerfyl C. in W. School.</p> <p>However, as outlined on page 34 of the draft Equalities Impact Assessment, ‘the aim of the proposal is to improve the educational opportunities available to all pupils, regardless of their ethnic group, therefore whilst there may be an impact on these pupils in the short term as they would need to attend school at a different location, the authority’s view is that the proposal would not have a negative impact on them in the longer term.’</p>
5.2.4	There are a higher number of pupils with Special Educational Needs at Llanerfyl, therefore closure of this school would have a greater impact on them and on their well-being. The School Organisation Code says that ‘relevant bodies should pay	Consideration has been given to the impact of the proposal on children with Special Educational Needs (SEN), as required by the School Organisation Code. The impact of each option to establish a new school on the current Banw site is considered

	particular attention to the impact of the proposals on vulnerable groups, including children with Special Educational Needs (SEN)'	<p>on page 35 of the Consultation Document, and on page 33 of the Impact Assessment Document produced, as part of the draft Equalities Impact Assessment.</p> <p>As indicated on page 35 of the Consultation Document, 'Any change of school and any disruption not of the learner's or their family's choosing is going to have some impact on feelings of wellbeing. This will have a greater impact on pupils required to move school sites. Mitigation of possible negative effects of change, especially for those with additional needs, will need to be well planned and allow for individual plans of support to be in place.'</p>
5.2.5	Concern about the impact on autistic children who may struggle in bigger, noisier classes.	This concern is noted. The impact on pupils with additional learning needs is considered on pages 21 and 35 of the consultation document. As identified on these pages, should the Council proceed with a proposal to establish a new school on either of the current sites, 'The Council would work in partnership with pupils with additional learning needs, parents and the schools to support an effective transition'.
5.2.6	When any change is implemented, important that a plan is put in place so that children with additional needs can slowly be introduced to a bigger school	<p>This concern is noted. The impact on pupils with additional learning needs is considered on pages 21 and 35 of the consultation document. As identified on these pages, should the Council proceed with a proposal to establish a new school on either of the current sites, 'The Council would work in partnership with pupils with additional learning needs, parents and the schools to support an effective transition'.</p> <p>Whilst it is acknowledged that any new school likely to be established will have more pupils than currently attend Banw C.P. School or Llanerfyl C. in W. School, the new school remain a relatively small school, with less than 60 pupils.</p>

5.2.7	Keeping the school at Llanerfyl would act in the best interests of the majority of pupils and in particular the most at risk group of children (those with SEN and those belonging to BME group)	<p>The proposal's impact on pupils with SEN and pupils belonging to BME group is considered in the draft impact assessments carried out in respect of this proposal. The draft impact assessments will be updated to take account of issues raised during the consultation period, and will be taken into consideration when determining how to proceed.</p> <p>Whilst it is acknowledged that the proposal impacts on pupils with SEN and pupils belonging to BME group, the aim of the proposal is to improve the educational opportunities available to all pupils, including any pupils with additional learning needs and any pupils belonging to ethnic groups other than White British.</p>
5.2.8	How are you going to accommodate autistic spectrum, ADHD, cerebral palsy, epilepsy, dyslexia, ADD, physical needs – these are things that haven't been thought of	<p>The proposal's impact on pupils with additional learning needs has been considered on pages 21 and 35 of the consultation document. This would include pupils with conditions such as those listed. The Council's assessment of the impact on both options on pupils with additional learning needs is as follows:</p> <p>'All schools in Powys are responsible for meeting a child's additional learning needs, in accordance with the Council's ALN Strategy and Operational Guidance. The new school would be expected to adhere to the same guidance. Funding from the Council is delegated to individual schools to support pupils with additional learning needs, and this funding would be allocated to the new school, ensuring that needs continue to be met. The Council would work in partnership with pupils with additional learning needs, parents and the schools to support an effective transition.</p> <p>Any change of school and any disruption not of the learner's or their family's choosing is going to have some impact on feelings of wellbeing. Mitigation of possible negative effects of change,</p>

		especially for those with additional needs, will need to be well planned and allow for individual plans of support to be in place.’
5.3 Impact on quality of education		
5.3.1	I don't think there would be an improvement to the educational opportunities for pupils at Ysgol Dyffryn Banw by establishing a new school in Llanerfyl without significant investment	Comments noted. As indicated on page 41 of the consultation document:
5.3.2	Pupils would be disadvantaged by a move to Llanerfyl due to the cramped conditions and the absence of the existing superior facilities only a mile up the road	<p>‘Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken to address any issues relating to the building’s suitability, in order to ensure that the quality of accommodation is at least as good as the current provision:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify the scope of the work required - Dependent on the scale of the work required, the Council will consider what would be the appropriate funding source for this work. As the building is not owned by the Council, discussions would need to take place with the Priscilla Foster Trust.’
5.3.3	The new curriculum has 6 areas of Learning and Experience. The first two are Expressive Arts and Health and Well-being. Ensuring facilities area available to enable the delivery of these key requirements should be paramount to the decision-making process if we value our children’s education	Comment noted.
5.4 Other		
5.4.1	The children are the ones that will suffer if a wrong decision is made – the physical, intellectual, emotional and social well-being of each child is of paramount importance	Comment noted.

5.4.2	<p>Quotes from the consultation document seem to be clear in concluding that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - If pupils moved from Llanerfyl to Banw, they would benefit due to the improved size and facilities available - If pupils moved from Banw to Llanerfyl, they would be negatively impacted. Existing pupils at Llanerfyl would also be disadvantaged due to the increased pupil numbers 	Comments noted.
5.4.3	<p>If the Llanerfyl pupils came to Banw it would be a win win situation – Banw children would have more social interaction and Llanerfyl children would have more facilities. If Banw pupils went to Llanerfyl, it would be a lose lose situation – Llanerfyl pupils would have less space individually and Banw pupils would be losing the hall and facilities</p>	<p>As outlined in the Consultation Document, there are advantages and disadvantages associated with both site options.</p>
5.4.4	<p>Pupils from the two schools would have to get to know each other</p>	<p>It is true that should the Council proceed with one of the options, pupils would be need to get to know each other. However, the Council would work with the two schools in order to establish new school, and it is hoped that opportunities could be provided for pupils to get to know each other during the period before the school opens.</p>

6. PUPIL NUMBERS		
6.1 It's unfair to close Llanerfyl School		
6.1.1	<p>Pupil numbers at Llanerfyl are increasing</p>	<p>As outlined in the Consultation Document, pupil numbers at Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School have decreased over recent years, from a maximum of 51 in January 2012 to 32 in January 2018. The latest projected pupil numbers available for</p>

		the school also do not suggest any significant increase in pupil numbers at the school over the next few years.
6.1.2	A reduction in pupil numbers in Banw School is the problem – it was the same situation 30 years ago, when the Council wanted to close Llanerfyl School and transfer the children to Banw.	As outlined in the Consultation Document in respect of this proposal, pupil numbers at both schools have decreased over recent years.
6.1.3	Although numbers at Llanerfyl School are declining, this is at a much slower rate than Banw CP School. Llanerfyl School's track record of community support will ensure that the school continues to thrive.	
6.1.4	The governing body at Banw School approached the Council because their numbers had dropped, and Llanerfyl School is suffering because of it	
6.1.5	Banw pupil numbers are low whilst the projected numbers at Llanerfyl are consistent – surely it makes more sense to disrupt the minority rather than the majority? Since when has Powys closed the school with the larger number of pupils to save the school that has the least number of children?	
6.1.6	It is morally wrong to close the school where the majority of the pupils attend (Llanerfyl) to a school with seriously falling numbers (Banw).	The Council is not proposing to close the school with the larger number of pupils to save the school that has the least number of children. Whilst it acknowledged that pupil numbers at Banw C.P. School are lower than pupil numbers at Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School, and are projected to decrease further over the next few years, pupil numbers across the Banw Valley have decreased over recent years, and are not projected to increase over the next few years.
6.1.7	Projected pupil numbers in consultation document suggest that pupil numbers in Llanerfyl School will remain stable for the next 5 years, whilst Dyffryn Banw numbers are down to as low as 13 by 2022. Why should Llanerfyl children suffer as a result of Ysgol Dyffryn Banw being unable to attract enough pupils to satisfy its future?	The Council is proposing to close the two schools and establish one new school in either of the two sites, in order to ensure continued provision of high quality Welsh-medium education for pupils in the area.
6.1.8	Predicted number for January 2022 is 13 in Banw School but 31 for Llanerfyl. 31 is still a large enough number of pupils for a	

	school to remain viable. If Llanerfyl School was located anywhere else in Powys, closing it would not be a consideration.	
6.1.9	Llanerfyl's geographical proximity to Ysgol Dyffryn Banw where numbers are small is the only reason why it's future is under threat – other authorities in Wales would treasure such a school and would do all they could to protect it	
6.1.10	Can the Council give examples of when they have previously closed a school with a larger number of pupils to save a school that has the smaller number of pupils? By 2020, projected figures show only 18 pupils at Banw.	
6.1.11	Not in any community previously has school B been closed to save school A. It would be severely unfair and a judicial review would follow if the decision was to close Llanerfyl.	
6.1.12	The school needs to be where the pupils are, and this is Llanerfyl – it's not practical to move a whole school population to a school where there are very few children.	
6.1.13	Closing Llanerfyl School would not act in the best interests of the majority of learners – projected number of pupils in Key Stage 1 is more than double in Ysgol Llanerfyl, so why move the majority of learners (13) for the benefit of the minority (6) in Key Stage 1? These are children who will be greatly affected given their young age and vulnerability – the School Organisation Code states that 'Proposers should ensure that the disruption to learners is minimised'	<p>The authority is concerned about the overall sustainability of pupil numbers in the whole area and establishing one school is a solution that was supported by both governing bodies.</p> <p>The authority recognises that any changes resulting from school reorganisation can be worrying for pupils. However, the authority works with school communities to ensure that the impact of any change is minimised. There is also responsibility on the leadership and management of any school to ensure that the wellbeing of pupils.</p>
6.1.14	Is Ysgol Pontrobert under threat because of its pupil numbers? Ysgol Llanerfyl shouldn't be sacrificed because of pupil numbers at Banw	The Council is not currently reviewing Ysgol Pontrobert. As outlined on page 6 of the Consultation Document, the review of primary provision in the Banw Valley was instigated following

		initial contact from Banw C.P. School, and has involved a number of steps as outlined in the Consultation Document. The review has been carried out in accordance with the Council's School Organisation Policy (2018).
6.2 Surplus places		
6.2.1	School Organisation Code states that 'Where there are more than 10% surplus places in an area overall, local authorities should review their provision and should consider whether to make proposals for their removal if this will improve the effectiveness and efficiency of provision. A significant level of surplus provision is defined as 25% or more of a school's capacity (as defined in Circular 21/2011) and at least 30 unfilled places. Should the new school be in Banw, I know of at least 12 children who would not be attending, therefore there is every likelihood that a school on that site would open its doors with only 36 pupils. The cost per pupil would be higher than other schools in Powys, and there would be at least 50% surplus places. The school could well be facing closure again within a few years.	<p>The Council acknowledges that a number of surplus places would remain in Banw C.P. School should a new school be established here, however there would be a significant overall reduction in the number of surplus places across the Banw Valley area.</p> <p>Following a decision on the way forward for the provision of primary education in the Banw Valley, parents would need to decide whether they would wish for their children to attend the new school or an alternative school. Should they wish their children to attend an alternative school, it is acknowledged that this would impact on pupil numbers at the new school. This is acknowledged as a risk on pages 20 and 34 of the consultation document.</p>
6.2.2	If all pupils from Llanerfyl went to Banw, there would still be close to 40% surplus places, which is deemed as 'significant' under the WAG School Organisation Code.	The Council acknowledges that a number of surplus places would remain in Banw C.P. School should a new school be established here, however there would be a significant overall reduction in the number of surplus places across the Banw Valley area.
6.2.3	Many Llanerfyl parents wouldn't take their children to Banw because of historical family prejudices, therefore there wouldn't be enough children at the school, and this school would again be under threat of closure in the near future	Following a decision on the way forward for the provision of primary education in the Banw Valley, parents would need to decide whether they would wish for their children to attend the new school or an alternative school. Should they wish their children to attend an alternative school, it is acknowledged that this would impact on pupil numbers at the new school. This is

		acknowledged as a risk on pages 20 and 34 of the consultation document.
6.2.4	The capacity of Llanerfyl school is only 44 + 5 nursery and the projected pupil numbers for 2020 is 48. The school would be at capacity from day 1 and unable to take any more pupils. Projected pupil numbers over 5-10 years are difficult to predict and the Council should build a +/- 10 capacity to any building in order to future proof it. It would be a shortsighted move by the Council to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site	Whilst the capacity of Llanerfyl School based on current use is 44 + 5 nursery, the Council has carried out a revised capacity calculation of the school in accordance with the Welsh Government Circular 21/2011 'Measuring the Capacity of Schools in Wales', which includes the Art room as a class base. As indicated on page 32 of the consultation document, this provides a capacity of 59 + 5, which can accommodate all current and projected pupil numbers in the two schools.
6.3 Projected pupil numbers		
6.3.1	Should pupil projections have been underestimated, would be a real shame for the local community should the local school not be able to meet demand if the school was located in Llanerfyl	The Council notes these comments and acknowledges that there is uncertainty with regard to projected pupil numbers – as outlined on page 9 of the consultation document, 'These projected pupil numbers are based on a combination of the latest PLASC figures available, live birth information and information held by the Council's finance team, which is supplied by the schools themselves. However, it is acknowledged that the projected pupil numbers are subject to change.' Whilst it is possible that actual pupil numbers will be higher than the projected pupil numbers, it is also possible that actual pupil numbers will be lower than the projected pupil numbers.
6.3.2	Although not projected on the consultation, I feel that pupil numbers could rise in the future once there is stability in the site of the new school. Many parents moving to the area have enrolled their children into neighbouring schools because of the threat of closure for both schools.	
6.3.3	Projected figures show that there isn't a need for such a large school as Banw in the Dyffryn Banw area	As indicated in the Consultation Document, the projected pupil numbers suggest that the capacity at both current schools is sufficient to accommodate all pupils currently attending the two schools, and the projected pupil numbers for the next few years.
6.3.4	Due to the new development plan and planning policies, very few new houses will be erected in the valley in the future and as a result the size of Llanerfyl school would more than adequately serve the Dyffryn Banw community.	

6.3.5	The building in Banw is too big for the purpose of Welsh-medium education in the area. Planning laws will not allow large development within areas such as Dyffryn Banw as explained in Powys' policy H1 (Housing provision), therefore there is no need for a large capacity school in the area.	
6.3.6	Projected numbers are higher at Llanerfyl, however this should have no affect on the decision as both schools will be together whichever remains open. The suitability of the building as a school is the issue.	The Council's priority is to ensure the provision of high quality education for all pupils in the Banw Valley area, and believes the best way to achieve this is to close both current schools and open a new school in one of the two sites. Ensuring the best possible opportunities for pupils will be the main consideration when determining how to proceed.
6.3.7	Unlikely that pupils from different areas will be attracted to the area – generally parents will not transport their children in a different direction to their work place	Comment noted. However, as indicated in the consultation document, a number of pupils from the Banw Valley area currently receive home to school transport to access English-medium provision in Llanfair Caereinion. There is a potential that greater certainty with regard to the provision of education in the area could result in pupils accessing local Welsh-medium provision in the future.
6.3.8	Pupils choosing to attend alternative schools other than Dyffryn Banw was identified as a threat in the consultation document and in the report prepared for Cabinet. This is a real and ongoing threat. If Ysgol Dyffryn Banw site was chosen, there is a very high risk that we would lose Welsh-medium education in the valley altogether	Comment noted. 'Pupils might transfer to other schools instead of the proposed new school, which would impact on pupil numbers' is identified as risk for both options within the consultation document. The mitigation actions identified are to 'move forward with the process as swiftly as possible in order to limit the period of uncertainty for the community. Should the option be implemented, work with the two school communities to shape the new school'.
6.3.9	A question in the previous questionnaire asked whether parents would send their children to the opposing school. The answers which came back were that a percentage of parents would not be sending their children to the other school, whether it be Banw or Llanerfyl	

6.3.10	Cylch Meithrin Dyffryn Banw has 17 children on the register in 17/18	Comment noted.
--------	--	----------------

7. IMPACT ON STAFF		
7.1	Staff jobs should be protected – it would be unfair for staff to lose their jobs	As explained in the consultation document, should the Council proceed with establishing one new school to serve the area, ‘a temporary governing body would be appointed for an interim period, until the new school were to open. The temporary governing body would be responsible for appointing a headteacher for the new school, and would then work with the headteacher to develop the leadership, management and staffing structures for the new school.
7.2	Ensure that staff are retained in the new school by introducing small classes, more one to one help etc	
7.3	The uncertainty is putting a strain on staff – what will the future of their jobs be?	
7.4	What will be the impact on staff working part time – will they be able to do this in future?	<p>Implementation of the new staffing structure would be in accordance with the relevant HR Policies for teaching and support staff. As part of this process, there would be an opportunity for the temporary governing body to ‘ringfence’ all teaching and associated staff posts to staff currently employed within the existing schools in the first instance.’</p> <p>The Council acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal has an impact on staff at the affected schools. The Council is keen to conclude this process as quickly as possible, in order to minimise this period of uncertainty. Any staff needing support can be directed to the Powys Counselling Service.</p>
7.5	Need to ensure clear and regular communication with staff and their unions	Comment noted. Regular communication will be provided to staff and unions throughout this process.
7.6	Need to ensure that any reorganisation does not lead to compulsory redundancies, and that the positions in any new	The decision on ringfencing is made by the temporary governing body, however the Council encourages temporary governing bodies to ringfence when possible. Measures to

	staffing structure are ring-fenced to staff who are currently working in the schools, including part time staff	avoid compulsory redundancies are always considered as part of employment consultation exercises. These will include seeking volunteers, voluntary reduction in hours, job sharing, natural attrition (wastage), early restriction on recruitment, redeployment within the council and retraining of employees to meet requirements of vacant posts internally (as reasonable/proportionate). In line with legislation, part time staff would be treated no less favourably than full time staff.
7.7	If reorganisation takes place, there is a need to ensure that the processes for appointing to posts are fair for all candidates and to provide formal feedback to those that request it	The employment consultation process would include consultation on the selection criteria for appointing to posts within the new school. The process will be conducted in an open, fair and transparent manner at all stages. Feedback will be provided to unsuccessful candidates on request.
7.8	If reorganisation takes place, there is a need to be clear about what positions can be applied for and the requirements of those posts	The employment consultation process would include a proposed structure for the new school for comment, and would include consultation with staff and relevant trade unions. This would be underpinned by job descriptions for all posts.
7.9	Need to ensure that staffing structures include detailed job descriptions and appropriate management lines	
7.10	Agreement of structures should be as a result of thorough consultation with staff and their unions	
7.11	Governing bodies have a statutory duty under the School Teachers Pay and Conditions Document to ensure work life balance for teachers and school leaders. An assessment of impact on workload will need to take place in relation to any new arrangements.	The new school's Challenge Advisor will support the new governing body in ensuring that the Estyn guidance on reducing workload for teachers and headteachers is properly understood and implemented.
7.12	Any period of change creates uncertainty which can impact on staff well-being and morale.	The Council acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal has an impact on staff at the affected schools. The Council is keen to conclude this process as quickly as possible,

		in order to minimise this period of uncertainty. Any staff needing support can be directed to the Powys Counselling Service.
7.13	Would staff start at the bottom point of the pay grade following implementation of a new staffing structure for any new school?	Employees will continue on whatever point they are on at the moment if the job is on the same grade.
7.14	What would happen if staff didn't want to apply for a post in the new school?	This would depend on the redundancy position at the time. Staff would have to engage in the process, however in some cases if there was not a suitable post in the new structure, staff could receive redundancy.

8. IMPACT ON THE COMMUNITY		
8.1 Impact on the Banw Community		
8.1.1 Reference to use by community organisations of the building in which the school is located		
8.1.1.1	Dyffryn Banw football club could no longer function without the facilities provided by the hall	The Council notes these comments regarding use of the building currently occupied by Banw C.P School by a range of organisations.
8.1.1.2	Several county organisations find the size, location, facilities and access attractive, notably Ysgol Theatr Maldwyn, Powys Eisteddfod	
8.1.1.3	Dyffryn Banw FC – makes regular use of the school corridor and cloakroom nearest the hall along with the 'committee room' throughout the football season. Also use the car parking space around the school and hall on match days, when hosting junior festivals and for parking when the juniors are training on the pitch. Without these facilities being available, the club would face huge difficulty in being able to replace them to continue to operate, losing the men's senior team and the junior section	

	which has 60 players signed on. This would be a great loss to the community of Llangadfan and Llanerfyl	
8.1.1.4	Merched y Wawr regional committees have met three times a year in Banw since the Centre opened in the 1980s. A number of sub-committees meet on these evenings, so the school and the centre are used. Closing Ysgol y Banw would have a negative impact on Merched y Wawr and other organisations that hold regional meetings here	
8.1.1.5	The community hall is used for activities such as Urdd, football club, young farmers, parties	
8.1.1.6	The building and adjoining hall are used for a number of community activities e.g. YFC, local sporting activities, a community facility for hire for local events, community events hosted by the school	
8.1.1.7	The committee room is used for Welsh language governor training, INSET training arranged by the authority	
8.1.1.8	The building is used for live performances by companies such as Theatr Arad Goch, Mewn Cymeriad, Bara Caws, Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru as there is room for up to 300 to sit in the hall	
8.1.1.9	Cwmni Theatr Ieuencid Maldwyn rehearse here weekly, as well as the local YFC, local Football Club, Merched y Wawr – local and regionally, Associated Board of Royal School of Music hold piano exams here, Badminton Club, Table Tennis Club, location for Remembrance services	
8.1.1.10	Banw School are arguing that many societies use the school, however it is the adjoining community centre which is used not	The Council notes this comment, and notes that many societies which use the building, such as Cwmni Theatr Maldwyn and the local football club, use the hall / changing rooms rather than the

	the school itself – this would continue to be available after closing the school building	school itself.
8.1.1.11	Much has been made of the fact that Cwmni Theatr Maldwyn and the local football club use the site, however they use the hall / changing rooms, not the school	
8.1.1.12	Reference has been made to the importance of the ‘cerrig orsedd’ – however, the future of education shouldn’t be based on the siting of the ‘cerrig orsedd’	A decision on where to locate a new school to serve the Banw Valley area will not be based on the location of the ‘cerrig orsedd’.
8.1.1.13	Dyffryn Banw FC has developed a pitch separate from the school, and plans are in place to set up changing rooms by the pitch, which is a requirement to progress up the football association of Wales pyramid. If this were to happen, the club would not be reliant on Banw School for changing facilities	The Council notes this comment, and that Dyffryn Banw FC are looking to set up changing rooms by the pitch, which would mean that they would not be reliant on the facilities at the school. However at the current time, there are no changing rooms by the pitch.
8.1.1.14	It is argued that the football team use Banw school to change etc, however it would be simple enough to erect a shower unit on the football field, which would be more convenient	
8.1.1.15	What would happen to activities such as the football club if the school closed? I want to know what would happen to this and other activities if the school closed.	The Council’s current proposal only relates to the school, not the adjoining community hall. However, should the Council proceed with a proposal which would result in there no longer being a school on the site currently occupied by Banw C.P. School, the Council would need to determine the future use of the site, taking into account the complexities regarding the Community Hall’s lease. Should the outcome be that there was no community hall, organisations such as the football club would need to identify alternative locations for their activities.
8.1.2 Reference to the Community Centre		

8.1.2.1	Due to the co-location of the school with the Hall, they are entwined and rely on each other	<p>Comment noted. The Council acknowledges the links between the Hall and the school due to the fact that they are located within the same building, and that whilst the Council is not proposing any changes to the community centre, it is possible that closure of the school would impact on the community centre. The Council notes on page 14 of the consultation document that one of the weaknesses of the option to establish a new school operating from the current Llanerfyl site is 'Concern about the impact on the Banw Community Hall if there was no school located on the site.'</p> <p>The Council also identified on page 44 of the consultation document in the summary of the Community Impact Assessment carried out in respect of the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site that 'The Banw Community Hall is co-located with the school, therefore whilst the current proposal is not proposing any changes to the community hall, it is possible that removal of primary provision from the Banw site could impact on the community hall in the future.'</p> <p>The Council notes these comments regarding the lease of the Community Hall and complexities related to the co-location of the Hall and the school which would arise should the school close.</p>
8.1.2.2	The future of the conjoined Community Hall at Banw and some of its users are at real risk if there was no longer a school on the site	
8.1.2.3	A decision to close the school may affect the community centre which would be a loss to the whole area	
8.1.2.4	Concern about the financial consequences to the community centre should Ysgol Dyffryn Banw close	
8.1.2.5	The hall is a separate entity to the school – it has its own separate committee. Closure of the school would not mean closure of the community hall	
8.1.2.6	The hall and changing rooms have a separate entrance so could easily standalone from the remainder of the school	
8.1.2.7	The complexity and length of the community council's lease of the Hall, which includes parts of the Banw school footprint as well as a substantial parking area, undermines sales prospects for the school site	
8.1.2.8	Banw community hall lease includes shared access from the main road, the parking area in front of the hall and the main hall building and access lobby. In addition, it extends to three rooms within the footprint of the original school building. A condition of the lease is that the school has priority use of the whole leased area during normal school term time and during school hours. The lease stipulates financial arrangements between the Hall Committee and the School – PCC makes an annual capitation payment to the Hall in support of priority usage. All services	

	reach the Hall from within the school. The central heating boiler and oil store are on the school premises	
8.1.2.9	If the school closed, there would be implications to PCC due to the fact that it is adjacent to the hall – PCC would still have to maintain the building in line with H&S. Insurance would still have to be paid and heating would still be needed. If the building was demolished, the cost of demolition and removal would need to be taken into account	
8.1.2.10	<p>Banw Community Hall holds a 99 year lease from the County Council for the Community Hall. There are about 88 years still to run. The lease includes shared access from the main road, the parking area in front of the hall and the main hall building and access lobby. In addition, extends to three rooms within the footprint of the original school building. A condition of the lease is that the School has priority use of the whole leased area during normal school term time and during school hours. The lease stipulates financial arrangements between the Hall Committee and the School – PCC makes an annual capitation payment to the Hall in support of priority usage. All services reach the Hall from within the school. Central heating boiler and oil store are on school premises</p> <p>There are stipulations built into the lease relating to a County Council decision to close and demolish the school. Strict enforcement of those conditions would impose costs which far exceed the current finances and financial prospects of the Community Centre Committee and Community Council. Without detailed investigation of possible mitigation, the prospects for the Community Centre and potential Powys disposal receipts are bleak. Community Council wish to remind the County Council of Policy DM11 in the LDP relating to protection of Existing Community Facilities and Services.</p>	

8.1.2.11	Need to ensure it's just the schools that are evaluated and not the hall at Banw. The community hall at Banw can still function without the adjoining school. Toilets, kitchen and dining area are all directly adjacent to the hall, ensuring that all gatherings / functions could continue unaffected by closure of the school	<p>The Council's priority is to provide education of the highest quality for pupils in the Banwy Valley, and this will be the main consideration when determining how to proceed.</p> <p>However, the School Organisation Code (2013) states on page 29 that:</p> <p>'Where proposals involve the closure of a school the following information must be included in the consultation document:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The impact of proposals on the local community, particularly in rural areas...' <p>The summary of the findings of the draft community impact assessment carried out in respect of the option to establish any new school on the Llanerfyl site noted that 'The Banw Community Hall is co-located with the school, therefore whilst the current proposal is not proposing any changes to the community hall, it is possible that removal of primary provision from the Banw site could impact on the community hall in the future.'</p>
8.1.2.12	How financially viable is the community hall?	The viability of the Community Hall is not a consideration within this consultation.
8.1.2.13	Who pays for maintenance and upkeep of the hall?	The Community Hall is responsible for maintenance and upkeep of the hall.
8.1.2.14	It cost £100 to hire the Banw Community Hall for a recent charity event. Had the same event been held in Llanerfyl, it would have only cost £40.	Comment noted. Hire charges for the two community halls are determined by the management committee of each hall, and it is up to organisers of events in the local area which hall they choose to hold an event.
8.1.3 General impact on the community		

8.1.3.1	Removal of the school from Banw would not have such a big impact on the community as it would have in Llanerfyl as there are other facilities in Llangadfan e.g. a busy café, shop and public house. Llanerfyl does not have a café, shop or public house	The Council notes these comments. The Council's view is that closure of any school has an impact on the community in which the school is located, therefore the Council acknowledges that closure of either site would impact on that community. The Council's priority is to provide the best possible education for pupils in the area, and the Council's view is that establishing one new school to serve the whole Banw Valley area is the best way to achieve this.
8.1.3.2	The Banw community is more dispersed, so moving the school's location would not have such a great impact on the community.	
8.1.3.3	Banw School is in a much more prominent location than Llanerfyl School, on the A458 Trunk Road, and adjoins two of the largest housing estates in the Banw Valley. Having such a prominent site left vacant would impact on the residential amenity of nearby residents, would detract from the appearance of the wider community and the impression people have of the county.	
8.2 Impact on the Llanerfyl community		
8.2.1 Impact of closing the school on the village of Llanerfyl		
8.2.1.1	Losing the local school would have a negative impact on social activity, and on the village's Welsh life	The Council notes these comments regarding the impact of not having a school in Llanerfyl on the Llanerfyl community. The Council acknowledges that closure of any school will impact on the community in which it is located, however the Council's priority is to ensure the best possible educational provision for pupils in the Banw Valley for the future. A draft Community Impact Assessment was published with the consultation documentation, this will be updated to take account of issues raised during the consultation and will be considered by Cabinet when determining how to proceed. Should the Council proceed with establishing one new Welsh-
8.2.1.2	Losing the school from Llanerfyl would change the unique character of this Welsh speaking village for ever	
8.2.1.3	Llanerfyl School plays an important role in the community and brings the community together as there is no shop, café or public house in the village.	
8.2.1.4	Llanerfyl School is at the heart of the community, without it the village would have nothing	

8.2.1.5	Numerous activities take place throughout the year when the community come together to support the school and socialise, either in the village hall, the Church or the School itself.	medium school on either of the current sites, the school would be expected to serve the whole Banw Valley area, and the Council would expect the school to maintain community links across the area.
8.2.1.6	The school plays a vital part in the community, with its strong links to the Church, Cylch Meithrin and the wider community	
8.2.1.7	Llanerfyl School events involve the whole community, which is very important in a rural community such as this, where social isolation can be such a problem, especially for the elderly	
8.2.1.8	Closure of Llanerfyl site would have a greater impact on the Llanerfyl community as there is no shop/tea rooms or public house for local people to engage and interact, unlike Llangadfan	
8.2.1.9	Closing the school would be another step towards destroying the local community (e.g. after the local shop/post office closed)	
8.2.1.10	Llanerfyl as a village would be a very sad place without a school and the sounds of children playing at break times	
8.2.2 Impact on Llanerfyl Village Hall		
8.2.2.1	Should there be no school in Llanerfyl, there would be an impact on the village hall as there would be a reduction in the use of the Hall. This would have a financial impact on the hall, which could lead to its closure	The Council notes these comments regarding the use of Llanerfyl Village Hall by Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School, and the potential impact on the hall should there be no school in Llanerfyl.
8.2.2.2	Llanerfyl School make regular use of the Village Hall, and brings the community together by holding concerts, coffee mornings, or other activities such as discos and beetle drives	
8.2.2.3	The village hall in Llanerfyl is not directly attached to the school, so it would not be directly affected should the school be re-sited at the Dyffryn Banw site	The Council notes this comment. Whilst it is true that the village hall is located separately to the school, the school does make

		use of the village hall, therefore closure of the school would potentially impact on use of the village hall.
8.2.2.4	The village hall is the community hub of Llanerfyl, not the school	The Council notes this comment
8.2.2.5	Closure of Llanerfyl school would not affect the community hall	<p>In the Community Impact Assessment carried out in respect of this proposal, the Council identified that 'There is a Village Hall in Llanerfyl, which is located on a separate site to the school. Should there be no primary provision in the building occupied by Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School, it is unlikely that this would impact on the Village Hall, therefore this would continue to be available for community activities.'</p> <p>However, it is also acknowledged that there could be an impact on the Village Hall in terms of a reduction in income following loss of the school's use of the Hall.</p>
8.2.3 Other		
8.2.3.1	A high percentage of children at Llanerfyl school are from farming families. Recent evidence suggests that loneliness and mental health issues are high among farmers – they are at higher risk of social isolation. On average, one farmer commits suicide per week in the UK – let's not add to this problem by removing one element, which is so important in reducing this loneliness for people	The Council notes the comment. Whilst the Council is proposing to merge the two current schools and establish one new school in the area, there would continue to be access to primary provision in the Banw Valley.
8.3 General comments with regard to impact on the community		
8.3.1	Acknowledgement that loss of a school is detrimental to any community	The Council acknowledges that closure of any school would impact on the community served by that school. The Council's priority is to provide the best possible education for pupils in the area, and the Council's view is that establishing one new school to serve the whole Banw Valley area is the best way to achieve this.
8.3.2	The community locally has deteriorated a lot in 20 years, closing a school in either Llanerfyl or Llangadfan will not make a bit of difference to that village	

8.3.3	Reference to Wales Spatial Plan (2008 update) – refers to the social and physical well-being of the community, and that good access to services (which includes access to community services) is a key determinant of quality of life in rural areas	Comment noted.
8.3.4	To strengthen the community and potentially grow the Welsh language and educational opportunities for everyone, the new school needs to be established in the hub of the Dyffryn, its community centre, the football team, at the location that was built specifically for this purpose, with ample room for extension	Comment noted.

9. IMPACT ON THE WELSH LANGUAGE		
9.1 Impact on the Welsh language in the Banw community		
9.1.1	Although 85% of pupils at Banw School come from non Welsh speaking homes, Welsh is spoken consistently in the classes and on the yard	The comment is noted. The Council has no concern about standards in Welsh at either of the current schools.
9.1.2	In Banw, only 12% of children speak Welsh at home – 88% are from non Welsh speaking backgrounds, therefore their first language and preferred language is naturally going to be English	The comments are noted. However, the Council has no concern about standards in Welsh at either of the current schools.
9.1.3	At the recent Harvest thanksgiving service, the Headteacher of Banw School had to prompt the pupils as they could not answer the Welsh guest speaker’s questions – this shows that Welsh is not the first language of pupils.	As stated in the Welsh Language Impact Assessment carried out in respect of these proposals: ‘There are no concerns about standards in Welsh at both current schools. Both schools offer a wide range of Welsh language extra-curricular activities and have achieved the Welsh Language Charter bronze award and are now working towards the silver award. The Council would expect this to continue to be the case at any new school established in the

		Banw Valley area.'
9.1.4	It is a positive thing that the majority of pupils attending Ysgol Dyffryn Banw come from non Welsh speaking homes. This supports the aims of the Council's Welsh in Education Strategic Plan and the School Organisation Policy	The Council's aim is to increase the number of pupils educated through the medium of Welsh, in order to contribute to the Welsh Government aspiration to achieve a million Welsh speakers by the year 2050. The Council agrees that attracting pupils from non Welsh speaking homes to Welsh-medium education will be key in order to achieve this.
9.2 Impact on the Welsh language in the Llanerfyl community		
9.2.1	Welsh is the natural language of the yard in Llanerfyl	The Council notes these comments regarding use of the Welsh language in Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School and the wider Llanerfyl community. As indicated in the Welsh Language Impact Assessment carried out in respect of these proposals: 'There are no concerns about standards in Welsh at both current schools. Both schools offer a wide range of Welsh language extra-curricular activities and have achieved the Welsh Language Charter bronze award and are now working towards the silver award. The Council would expect this to continue to be the case at any new school established in the Banw Valley area.'
9.2.2	80% of pupils in Llanerfyl School come from home where at least one of their parents speak Welsh	
9.2.3	All governors of Llanerfyl School are Welsh speaking, and meetings are held in Welsh. The Community Councillors are also all Welsh speaking, and the majority of Village Hall committee members. This is something that is quite unique in Powys these days	
9.2.4	Llanerfyl is a natural Welsh speaking school with at least 75% of pupils speaking Welsh at home in comparison to a very small number of pupils at Banw. There would be greater impact on the Welsh language should the school not be in Llanerfyl. Many parents would send their children to the English stream at Llanfair Caereinion should the school be based in Banw – this would have a profound effect on the Welsh language in the valley as the Welsh language would be considerably diluted, and goes against the Welsh Government aim of having 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050	
		Implementation of the proposal would result in the establishment of one new, larger school in the Banw Valley area, and the Council's view is that this would contribute towards the Welsh Government aspiration to achieve a million Welsh speakers by the year 2050. This is supported by Estyn in their response to this consultation, which states that: 'Both <i>option a and b</i> would contribute to realising the Welsh Government's strategy of achieving a million Welsh speakers by 2050'.

9.2.5	Llanerfyl is unique in the area by having a core of Welsh speaking families living and moving into the area. This is reflected in 75% of pupils at the school speaking Welsh at home.	Should the Council proceed with the proposal to establish one new Welsh-medium school to serve the area, the Council would hope that all pupils attending the two current primary schools in the area would transfer to that new school, ensuring continued access to Welsh-medium education in a Welsh-medium school. However, all parents are entitled to apply for a place for their child in whichever school they choose, and these applications will be accommodated in accordance with the Council's admissions policy.
9.2.6	If Llanerfyl school closed, some parents will be sending their children to the English stream in Llanfair Caereinion, which will reduce the number of pupils accessing Welsh-medium education and will be a step backwards in the Welsh Government's plan to reach a million Welsh speakers by 2050.	
9.2.7	Closing Llanerfyl School would irrevocably damage the Welsh language and Welsh medium provision in the area, the core of Welsh speakers would be split up, friends and families will be split with parents considering sending their children to five different schools	
9.2.8	Llanerfyl School is an integral part of the Welsh community that exists in Llanerfyl	The Council notes these comments relating to the role of the Welsh language within the Llanerfyl community. Should the Council proceed with implementation of the proposal, a new Welsh-medium primary school would be established to serve the whole Banw Valley. There is no reason to believe that this would have a detrimental impact on the Welsh language in Llanerfyl.
9.2.9	Llanerfyl School plays an important role in the continuance of the Welsh language in the community	
9.2.10	The Welsh language community of Llanerfyl is thriving, with more and more young families moving to the village	
9.2.11	Greatest fear is that closing the school would be detrimental to the Welsh language in the community	
9.2.12	The community of Llanerfyl is a stronghold for the Welsh language, and the school plays a vital role in ensuring it remains so	
9.2.13	Llanerfyl is the strongest area in terms of Welsh speaking – it's important to continue with the Welsh medium primary school within the most predominantly Welsh area	

9.2.14	The Welsh language is stronger in Llanerfyl. There is no doubt that moving children to Banw would weaken the Welsh language in the community	
9.2.15	Consultation on the school organisation code published this year identified the need to protect or maintain schools where Welsh is the natural language of the community. 75% of pupils attending Llanerfyl School are from a Welsh speaking background, compared with only 12% of children attending Ysgol Dyffryn Banw.	This consultation has been carried out in accordance with the School Organisation Code (2013), and a draft Welsh language impact assessment has been carried out in accordance with the Code's requirements. This assessment will be updated to reflect the comments received during the consultation period, and will be considered when determining how to proceed.
9.3 General comments with regard to impact on the Welsh language		
9.3.1	The impact of losing pupils from Welsh speaking homes who currently attend Llanerfyl, many of whom would not attend Banw school, would have a significant impact on the language spoken on the yard, and on the ability of non Welsh speaking pupils to absorb and learn the Welsh language by hearing it being spoken naturally	<p>As outlined in the Welsh language impact assessment carried out in respect of the proposals relating to Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School, 'There are no concerns about standards in Welsh at both current schools. Both schools offer a wide range of Welsh language extra-curricular activities and have achieved the Welsh Language Charter bronze award and are now working towards the silver award. The Council would expect this to continue to be the case at any new school established in the Banw Valley area.'</p> <p>Implementation of the proposal would result in the establishment of one new, larger school in the Banw Valley area, and the Council's view is that this would contribute towards the Welsh Government aspiration to achieve a million Welsh speakers by the year 2050. This is supported by Estyn in their response to this consultation, which states that: 'Both <i>option a and b</i> would contribute to realising the Welsh Government's strategy of achieving a million Welsh speakers by 2050'.</p>

9.3.2	School Organisation Policy states ‘the Council aims to...increase demand for Welsh-medium education and provides access to provision that will enable pupils to become confident Welsh speakers’	The Council’s view is that the proposal to establish a new school on either site would meet this aim and the Welsh Government aspiration to achieve a million Welsh speakers by the year 2050. This is supported by Estyn in their response to this consultation, which states that: ‘Both <i>option a</i> and <i>b</i> would contribute to realising the Welsh Government’s strategy of achieving a million Welsh speakers by 2050’.
-------	--	---

10. REFERENCE TO EARLY YEARS PROVISION		
10.1	Query whether the current location of the Cylch Meithrin in a village hall is ideal considering that there is an opportunity to establish a permanent Cylch Meithrin that would attract more children on the school campus at Ysgol Dyffryn Banw.	The Council notes this comment. The opportunity to look at locating early years provision on site was identified on page 19 of the Consultation Document as one of the ‘Reasons for the Proposal’ in relation to establishing a new school on the current Banw site.
10.2	Locating the Cylch Meithrin on school land would enrich the offer of the proposed new school, and would also facilitate the possibility of providing wraparound care	
10.3	Support for the principle of relocating the Cylch Meithrin to the site of the new school, on the condition that appropriate permanent indoor and outdoor space is available, which meets the requirements of CSSIW, Estyn and any other regulatory body. Would also request space for staff to keep resources and materials.	The Council notes these comments. Any plan to relocate the Cylch Meithrin to the site of the new school would be made in full discussion with the Cylch Meithrin to ensure that the provision met their requirements and the requirements of regulatory bodies such as CSSIW and Estyn.

11. FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS		
11.1 Transport costs		

11.1.1	Transporting pupils from Banw to Llanerfyl would be much less than the cost of maintaining the Banw building	Estimated additional transport costs have been included in the estimated savings illustrated in the Consultation Document in respect of this proposal. It is true that transporting all pupils currently attending Banw C.P. School to Llanerfyl and closing Banw C.P. School would result in an overall saving to the Council, however the same is true should the Council transport all Llanerfyl pupils to Banw.
11.1.2	The Council would save money by not having to provide as much transport for children if the school was in Llanerfyl, but is that a justified reason for locating the new school there?	There would be savings to the Council should there be one new school in the Banw Valley to replace the current two schools, regardless of the location of the new school. There are strengths and weaknesses associated with both possible locations, these are outlined in the Consultation Document issued in respect of this proposal.
11.1.3	Transport costs would be greater if the new school was in Banw as there would be more pupils to transport to the new school	An estimate of the impact of implementation of both options on school transport costs was received, and included in the Consultation Document.
11.1.4	If more than twice as many children need to be transported to Banw, the cost is naturally going to be greater than if the school was in Llanerfyl, even though the document says that the extra travel cost involved would be the same.	As outlined in the Consultation Document, the estimate 'takes into account the impact of this option on the total cost of home to school transport in the Banw Valley, which includes transport to Caereinion High School and NPTC College.' Based on this assessment, it is estimated that implementation of either option 'would result in an increase in the daily cost of home to school transport from the current cost of £546.02 per day to approximately £730 per day'.
11.1.5	Transporting the majority of pupils from Llanerfyl to Banw would create a large increase in transport costs – currently only 3 Llanerfyl pupils receive transport	It would not be possible to calculate the actual costs until the location of the new school was known, as well as which pupils would be attending the school.
11.1.6	As well as transport to Banw, the Council would need to provide free transport to Llanerfyl parents who choose to send their children to the English stream in Llanfair Caereinion	Parents are entitled to choose English-medium provision if that is their preference, and as admissions authority, the Council has to accommodate these choices. Home to school transport

11.1.7	The Council keeps telling us it is short of money, yet it carries 15 children each day to Llanfair Caereinion primary site from the Banw valley – your own policy seems to be shooting yourself in the foot	<p>would be provided to eligible pupils in accordance with the Council's Home to School Transport Policy, which states that 'For those qualifying pupils who wish to receive their education through the medium of English or Welsh, transport will be provided to the nearest allocated school/centre for primary school pupils providing education through that language medium. In order to qualify pupils must meet the standard qualifying criteria.'</p> <p>Should the Council proceed with a proposal to establish a new school, the Council would hope that pupils that currently attend Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School would transfer to the new school, where they would continue to access Welsh-medium provision in a Welsh-medium school, however this would be a decision for pupils and their parents.</p>
11.2 Capital receipts		
11.2.1 Reference to selling the Banw site		
11.2.1.1	With the cuts and savings the Council is facing, selling the Banw building would help to fill the Council's coffers	The Council notes these comments. The potential that the Council could achieve a capital receipt from sale of the Banw C.P. School building was identified on page 33 of the Consultation Document in respect of this proposal.
11.2.1.2	Selling all or part of the Banw site releases much needed capital to the Council	
11.2.1.3	Selling Banw school could be used to enhance the site at Llanerfyl in the longer term	
11.2.1.4	If the Council needs to sell Neuadd Maldwyn, why not sell Banw School too	
11.2.1.5	The ownership of the Banw site allows possibilities for generation of much needed cash, whereas Llanerfyl gives no such opportunity.	

11.2.2 Reference to the Llanerfyl site		
11.2.2.1	The Council doesn't own the Llanerfyl building, so there would be no financial benefit to the Council from closing it	The Council notes this comment, and acknowledges that the Llanerfyl building isn't owned by the Council. This was acknowledged on page 19 of the Consultation Document – 'The Council would not benefit from any sale of the Llanerfyl site as it isn't owned by the Council.'
11.3 Capital costs		
11.3.1 Reference to improvements to the Banw site		
11.3.1.1	The cost of improvements to the Banw building would be much less than the option of investing in a piece of land to extend the buildings/grounds – this is not covered in the consultation document	The current proposals are based on establishing a new school in either of the two current buildings in their current condition. However, as explained in the Consultation Document, should a decision be made to proceed with either of the options, steps would be taken to ensure that the quality of accommodation for all pupils is at least as good as their current provision.
11.3.1.2	Alarming to see that the site at Banw would require £211,025 more to maintain over the next 5 years – how can this be justified in the current climate?	The Council has a duty to maintain school buildings to a standard that enables good teaching and learning. Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Banw site, the Council would take steps to identify the scope of the work required to the building, and take appropriate steps to identify the appropriate funding source and commission the work, as outlined on page 26 of the Consultation Document.
11.3.1.3	Ongoing maintenance costs may be a bit more for the Banw site, but this is to be expected because it is a much larger building with more components/facilities to maintain. At a cost per square metre, the Banw site surely provides better value	Comment noted. Financial implications are one consideration of many to be taken into consideration when determining how to proceed.

11.3.2 Reference to improvements to the Llanerfyl site		
11.3.2.1	According to the consultation document, no capital funding has been allocated to provide additional facilities at Ysgol Llanerfyl, therefore this can't be taken into consideration when making a decision on the site	The Consultation Document makes clear that no capital funding is required to achieve either option. There is sufficient capacity within the two current buildings to accommodate the current and forecasted pupils at the two schools. Should the Council proceed with either option, steps would be taken to identify any investment needed, however a decision on the way forward will be based on the current buildings.
11.3.2.2	Cost of the upgrades required to Banw would be significantly less than the extension required at Llanerfyl to give the building the facilities it needs to enable it to function as a successful school.	
11.3.2.3	It would be a huge waste of taxpayers money (and possibly not even lawful) to invest in the Llanerfyl site which is not even owned by Powys CC, when a perfectly good one is available at Banw	
11.3.3 Other		
11.3.3.1	Both buildings need some maintenance work. Costings state that Banw needs approx. £388,275 over 5 years to get it to the desired standard. At the end of the 5 years, there would be a school with full facilities in good condition. The same report states that Llanerfyl would need £177,356 over a 5 year period to get to the desired standard. However, this does not include money needed for an extension which has been mentioned, and the school will still not have the facilities that Banw has. I'm sure the money that would need to be spent on Llanerfyl would be substantially more than £177,356.	Comment noted.
11.3.3.2	The County Times (19 th October) ran an article suggesting Llanerfyl could apply for a grant of a million pounds. Has this been misreported and if not why can Banw not apply for this funding?	Yes, this was misreported.

11.3.3.3	How could the council justify capital expenditure on another property not owned by the Council when Banw has all the facilities needed?	The Council is not currently planning any capital expenditure on either property. As outlined in the Consultation Document, should the Council proceed with either option outlined in the document, steps would be taken to identify any improvements required and funding arrangements.
11.3.3.4	Should the schools merge, would the funding for Llanerfyl School be available to be transferred to Banw School to help facilitate improvements to the condition?	If the two schools merge, the new school would be funded as one school in accordance with the funding formula. Other than funding linked to pupil numbers, funding linked to the closed site wouldn't automatically transfer to the new school.
11.3.3.5	Consultation document states on p14 and p34 that capital investment would be required to provide additional facilities, whereas on p25 no capital funding is required at Banw. In view of this, would Powys be prepared to spend money on a building they do not own and would the Trust who own it want such alteration to their building?	<p>As outlined on page 41 of the Consultation Document:</p> <p>'Should the Council proceed with the option to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the following steps would be taken to address any issues relating to the building's suitability, in order to ensure that the quality of accommodation is at least as good as the current provision:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Commission HOWPS to carry out further work to identify the scope of the work required - Dependent on the scale of the work required, the Council will consider what would be the appropriate funding source for this work. As the building is not owned by the Council, discussions would need to take place with the Priscilla Foster Trust.'
11.3.3.6	Would like to see the same kind of investment in the valley as has been seen in the new primary schools in the south of the county to give the children the best opportunity with the best teachers at the best new school in Powys – this is what the children deserve	The Council follows a process of prioritisation as outlined in the Schools Asset Management Plan when determining which schools will receive capital investment. The Council currently has no plans to invest in schools in the Banw Valley area, however should the Council wish to do so, business cases would need to be submitted to the Welsh Government for approval in order to access capital funding.

11.4 Cost per pupil		
11.4.1	Having the school on the Llanerfyl site would make more economical and financial sense as the school would have far fewer surplus places and would cost less per pupil than if the school was on the Banw site	<p>It is true that the cost per pupil of a new school on the Llanerfyl site would be lower than the cost per pupil on the Banw site. Based on the estimates provided in the Consultation Document, and an estimate of 54 pupils, the cost per pupil of a school on the Llanerfyl site would be £3945, whilst the cost per pupil of a school on the Banw site would be £4208. This is because more funding would be provided to a school on the Banw site due to factors such as the building condition and the square meterage.</p> <p>However, establishment of a new school on either site would result in an overall saving to the Council, and a reduction in surplus places in the area. Financial implications are one of a number of matters to be taken into consideration when determining how to proceed.</p>
11.4.2	Providing education at Llanerfyl would be more cost effective as the cost per pupil would be significantly less (over £350 per pupil). Cost per pupil at Banw is likely to increase as at least 12 children from Llanerfyl will not attend a new school should it be located at Banw	It is true that there would be an impact on the cost per pupil of a new school located on the Banw site should at least 12 children currently attending Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School not attend the school. However this is also true should pupils currently attending Banw C.P. School decide not to attend a new school located on the current site of Llanerfyl School.
11.4.3	Banw has the highest cost per pupil in Powys because of a building which is too big, lack of numbers and transportation costs	There are numerous factors which affect a school's cost per pupil. Cost per pupil only includes funding elements which are delegated, this doesn't include transport costs, therefore transport costs aren't a reason for the current cost per pupil of Banw C.P. School.
11.5 Reference to financial contribution from the Church		
11.5.1	If an extension was needed to the Llanerfyl site, the financial burden on the Council would not be too great as the St Asaph	If an extension was needed to the Llanerfyl then it would be considered by both the Council and the Diocese/Trustees.

	diocese has promised to contribute to the cost, and with a contribution from the Welsh Government it would not cost as much as the maintenance costs for Ysgol Dyffryn Banw	Funding could be applied for through 21 st Century School Programme. As a Voluntary Aided school any potential funding through the 21 st Century Schools Programme would be at a rate of 85% Welsh Government grant aid. The council can also help with the 15% governor responsibility. If the school were on the site of Banw the same funding stream would potentially be available as the school would be a Voluntary Aided school.
11.5.2	Connection with the Church in Wales allows for some match funding for any future projects which may be necessary	
11.5.3	The Diocese in St Asaph has said that it would be prepared to introduce capital should the school be located on the Llanerfyl site – questionable whether such funding would be available should the school be at Banw	
11.6 Priscilla Foster Trust		
11.6.1	Llanerfyl School benefits from an annual sum of £500 from the Priscilla Foster Trust	The Council notes this comment, and notes the financial contribution which Llanerfyl School currently receives from the Priscilla Foster Trust.
11.6.2	The school building in Llanerfyl has been left in trust to the children of Llanerfyl. It would be a shame not to use this asset, surely it would make economical sense?	The Diocese of St Asaph has for many years endowed schools to serve their local area. Regardless of the site of the new school, the Diocese would work with Powys County Council and the local community to ensure that any asset was used for the benefit of the children in the locality.
11.6.3	The Priscilla Foster Trust was established to provide an education for the children of the Parish – such funding may not be forthcoming should the school be sited at Banw	The new school would still be meeting its original charitable purpose if it was providing education for the children of the parish, even if it was sited in Llangadfan.
11.6.4	There seems no evidence to assume that the Priscilla Foster Trust could not be persuaded to consider investing in the Banw site from the proceeds of disposal if Banw were to become a C in W School	
11.7 Overall savings to the Council		

11.7.1	The consultation document indicates that closing Banw and opening the new school on the Llanerfyl site would be a greater financial saving to the authority (£14,000) – I don't understand why this should be. However, would be very disappointed if the decision were money led when this could be detrimental to the children's welfare and education	It is true that the Consultation Document indicates that establishing a new school on the current Llanerfyl site would result in a greater financial saving to the Council. This is because more funding is provided to the Banw site in relation to premises costs. Whilst financial impact is one element to be considered with regard to school reorganisation proposals, this is only one of a number of considerations. The Council's priority is to ensure the best possible education for pupils.
11.7.2	As a taxpayer, the Council has a duty to demonstrate to me and others that they make prudent and sustainable long term decisions. A saving of £14,200 would be made annually if the site was at Llanerfyl	It is true that the estimated costings provided in the Consultation Document suggest that there would be a greater saving to the Council should the new school be established in Llanerfyl, however, establishing a new school on the Banw site would still result in an estimated annual saving to the Council of £49,226.
11.7.3	The local authority has a duty to its tax payer, and the financial figures produced in the consultation paper shows that the site which is the most financially viable is the Llanerfyl site	Whilst financial impact is one element to be considered with regard to school reorganisation proposals, this is only one of a number of considerations. The Council's priority is to ensure the best possible education for pupils.

12. OTHER OPTIONS		
12.1 Retain both schools		
12.1.1	Keep both schools open	As indicated in the consultation document in respect of this proposal, there are many challenges facing the provision of education in the Banw Valley. These include low and decreasing pupil numbers, financial challenges, issues with building condition/ suitability and the need to continue to provide high quality provision.
12.1.2	Keep both schools open and support both to increase their numbers. If there was no threat of closure on either, more families would send their children to them	

12.1.3	Leave the schools as they are. It's not going to work having the two schools working together when there is bad feeling between them	<p>Consideration was given to 'Status Quo' as an option, however as indicated on page 16/17 of the consultation document, this was discounted because of the following reasons:</p> <p>'The Status Quo has been discounted because of the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There would still be small numbers of pupils at each school - Pupils would still be taught separately - Would still be running two buildings which would mean twice the cost - Would not reduce surplus places in the area - Would not lead to a financial saving to the council - No early years provision in either school - Would not address the financial pressures faced by the two schools - Further decline is expected in pupil numbers in the area.' <p>The discounting of the Status Quo option is also supported by the findings of the questionnaire published as part of this consultation exercise, where 83% of respondents agreed that merging the two schools was the most suitable way forward in order to safeguard the provision of Welsh-medium education in the area.</p>
12.2 Open a new school in a new location		
12.2.1	Open a brand new school in a new setting	<p>Consideration was given to 'A new school operating from a new site in the area' as an option, however as indicated on page 17 of the consultation document, this was discounted for the following reasons:</p>
12.2.2	Building a new school building between the villages would probably be acceptable to most in the valley, however it isn't	

	really an option because the Banw site is obviously an ideal setting for the new school as it stands	<p>'Option 4 (A new school operating from a new site in the area) has been discounted because of the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There are already two buildings in the area that can accommodate current pupil numbers - Would need to purchase land, which would add to the expense - No guarantee that Welsh Government would provide funding as the new school would be very small - Would not provide good value for money based on potential investment per pupil.'
12.2.3	Building a new school building between the villages would probably ease community friction, however I am sure that the most economical way forward is to use the Banw site	
12.2.4	If funding could be secured from the Welsh Government to fund a new build school under the 21 st Century Schools programme, you should look at the possibility of a brand new school on a new site	
12.2.5	This would be the most sensible option, offering excellent educational experiences for children in the area, as is the case in other rural areas e.g. 'Craig y Deryn', 'T Llew Jones'	
12.2.6	Disappointing that consideration hasn't been given to this option as part of Band B of the Welsh Government's 21 st Century Schools fund, or the recent Welsh-medium capital grant.	
12.3 Multi-sited option		
12.3.1	The two schools working together would be the best option	<p>Consideration was given to 'A new school operating across the two current site' as an option, however as indicated on page 17 of the consultation document, this was discounted for the following reasons:</p> <p>'Option 1 (A new school operating across the two current sites) has been discounted because of the following reasons:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There would still be small numbers of pupils on each site
12.3.2	One school on two sites would be acceptable whilst investigating the possibility of a new build on a new site in the area	
12.3.3	Retain the two schools under one headteacher – this happened 4 years ago when Llanerfyl, Dyffryn Banw and Glantwymyn were under one headteacher. Also for some years now Glantwymyn, Llanbrynmair and Carno have been run by one headteacher. This type of arrangement may help with some of the tensions	

	and concerns locally, and in time, merging may happen naturally with the support and goodwill of the whole community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Pupils would still be taught separately - Would still be running two buildings which would mean twice the cost - Would not reduce surplus places in the area - Would not lead to a financial saving to the council'
12.3.4	Wouldn't be cost effective to have a school operating on 2 sites	
12.3.5	Concern about the option of one establishment operating over 2 sites – communication suffers, reducing efficiency. Provision of resources is also less efficient	
12.4 Establish English-medium provision in the area		
12.4.1	Open an English-medium school in Banw to try and stop the migration down to Llanfair Caereinion from pupils wanting English-medium education	<p>As identified in the consultation document, it is true that a number of pupils from the Banw Valley area are currently transported to other schools in order to access English-medium provision. The Council is committed to providing continued access to Welsh-medium provision in the Banw Valley in order to contribute to the Welsh Government strategy to achieve a million Welsh speakers by the year 2050, and would hope that the establishment of one new school in the area, and greater certainty with regard to the future of education in the area, would lead to a reduction in the number of pupils accessing English-medium provision elsewhere in the future.</p>
12.4.2	A bilingual school in the area to keep those that travel to Meifod, Llanfair Caereinion, Castle Caereinion and Rhiw Bechan	
12.5 Carry out a wider review of education in the area		
12.5.1	The future of Welsh-medium primary and secondary education in the wider Caereinion catchment should also be under consideration.	<p>These comments are noted. The Council's current priority is to ensure continued access to high quality Welsh-medium education in the Banw Valley.</p>
12.5.2	Close both schools and build a larger Welsh-medium school in Llanfair Caereinion	
12.5.3	Would prefer to see the Council adopting a policy of clustering schools in the area. Closing a school would damage any community	

12.5.4	Build a larger school. All schools under 50 should be closed	
12.5.5	Invest in Llanfair Caereinion	
12.6 Increase pupil numbers in the area		
12.6.1	Understand what plans other agencies have in place that might lead to an increase in population numbers in the future e.g. NHS and MoD	The latest pupil projections for the two schools in the Banw Valley, as indicated on page 9 of the consultation document, do not suggest that an increase in pupil numbers in the area is likely over the next few years. Even if more families were to move to the area in the coming years, it is unlikely that this would have a sufficient impact on pupil numbers to justify the retention of both schools.
12.6.2	Attract more families to the area	
12.6.3	Stop providing transport to schools further away	Home to school transport is provided to pupils living in the Banw Valley area who choose to attend English-medium provision. This is in accordance with the Council's current Home to School Transport Policy, which states: 'For those qualifying pupils who wish to receive their education through the medium of English or Welsh, transport will be provided to the nearest allocated school/centre for primary school pupils providing education through that language medium. In order to qualify pupils must meet the standard qualifying criteria.'
12.6.4	Stop transporting children out of the area just because they don't want to learn Welsh. Make them see it as a good idea, and if they still want to go to an English-medium school, they should pay for transport themselves.	
12.7 Other		
12.7.1	Allow one school to come to a natural end rather than closing both	As indicated on page 9 of the consultation document, pupil numbers at both schools have decreased over the last few years. The Council's priority is to continue to provide Welsh-medium education of the highest quality to pupils in the Banw Valley in the future, and the Council does not believe that

		allowing 'one school to come to a natural end' is an acceptable solution.
12.7.2	Close both schools if people don't agree	The Council's current aim through these proposals is to provide continued access to Welsh-medium education in the Banw Valley.
12.7.3	Consider the possibility of the new school not being a voluntary aided C in W school, but a community school instead	Comment noted. Whilst the Council could have proposed establishment of a community school, the Council is proposing to establish a Voluntary Aided C. in W. School in order to provide continued access to Welsh-medium Church in Wales provision.
12.7.4	Consideration should be given to working with the Cylch Meithrin to provide wraparound care on the site (in the context of the 30 hour provision)	This will be a consideration once a final decision has been made on whether or not to proceed with their option.
12.7.5	Welsh language immersion centre to be located on the site of the new school as a resource for the county	The Council has committed in its WESP for 2017-20 to establish provision for latecomers in Powys, however this has not yet been progressed. Consideration will be given to a range of options in order to determine how to proceed.
12.7.6	Investment in technology to enable full use of specialisms in other schools	The Council is developing a digital learning strategy with a view that schools should have the ability to work collaboratively without having to travel.

13. REFERENCE TO DOCUMENTATION		
13.1 Consultation Documentation		
13.1.1	The consultation document does not provide a common set of objectives and facilities for the new school and compare the cost and implications of achieving those objectives at each of the	The consultation document is based on the current facilities available at the two schools. As outlined in the Consultation Document, consideration would be given to any investment

	potential sites – the intention seems to be to make a decision on the basis of other criteria, and only then work out what is going to be provided and at what cost	needed following a decision on where to locate the proposed new school.
13.1.2	Unclear what the capacity of the Llanerfyl building is as p.32 says 59+5 and p.51 says 44+5	As explained in the Consultation Document, the capacity figure of 44+5 on page 51 is the school's current capacity based on current use of the accommodation. The figure of 59+5 provided on page 32 is a re-calculated capacity figure, which includes the Art room within the school as a class base.
13.1.3	Would question the viability of the capacity figure of 59 for Llanerfyl	
13.1.4	The consultation document says that there are no walking routes to Banw School, however 27% of pupils walk daily to school from the housing estate which is behind the school	The Council notes this comment, and notes that pupils living in the housing estate behind Banw C.P. School walk to school.
13.1.5	The pupil projection figures need to be reviewed	As explained on page 9 of the Consultation Document, 'These projected pupil numbers are based on a combination of the latest PLASC figures available, live birth information and information held by the Council's Finance team, which is supplied by the schools themselves.' However, it is also acknowledged that pupil projection figures are subject to change – 'It is acknowledged that projected pupil numbers are subject to change'.
13.1.6	Pupil projections cannot be exact – for example people might move to the area.	
13.1.7	Disagree with the consultation document that the geographical location of Llanerfyl is better than Banw –Ysgol Dyffryn Banw is situated in the middle of the valley, between the three villages of Foel, Llangadfan and Llanerfyl.	The Council notes this comment, and acknowledges that Ysgol Dyffryn Banw is situated in the middle of the catchment area currently served by the two schools.
13.1.8	Access to Llanerfyl School is down a 'B' road, with space for two cars to travel down the lane without issue – not a narrow lane as incorrectly stated in the consultation document	The Council notes this comment, and that the 'narrow lane' referred to in the Consultation Document is in fact a 'B' road.
13.1.9	P.19 states that it would be more difficult for Llanerfyl to access after school activities at Banw – this is misleading because	Comment noted.

	many parents already attend activities at Banw village hall, including the boys football club	
13.1.10	P.14 Llanerfyl school may attract pupils from the Llanfair area, this is doubtful as Llanfair already has very good Welsh stream primary education	As stated on page 12 of the Consultation Document, as well as input from officers, the SWOT analyses for each of the options 'reflect comments provided by parents during initial engagement work carried out as part of the review process'.
13.1.11	p.14 states that there is land nearby which could be purchased to extend the Llanerfyl car park and building – is this for sale? How costly would it be to purchase? Is it close enough to the school to avoid having to walk to it? Is this going to be done before the new school opens?	These statements, which are identified as 'opportunities' in the SWOT analyses, were suggested by parents during this process.
13.1.12	Consultation document indicates that 26 children from the catchment area of both schools are travelling on a daily basis to a school further afield. There should be a policy from within the council to incentivise pupils to be educated at their nearest school. If a guardian decides to send their child further afield, the cost of transport should be from the individual not the council.	Comment noted. Home to school transport is provided to pupils living in the Banw Valley area who choose to attend English-medium provision. This is in accordance with the Council's current Home to School Transport Policy, which states: 'For those qualifying pupils who wish to receive their education through the medium of English or Welsh, transport will be provided to the nearest allocated school/centre for primary school pupils providing education through that language medium. In order to qualify pupils must meet the standard qualifying criteria.'
13.1.13	Misleading that the consultation document uses the condition assessment to conclude that 'therefore, there would be an improvement in the quality of accommodation for pupils currently attending Banw C.P. School' – it would be fair to say that it would result in pupils attending a 'building that is in better condition', but not 'better quality of education'. Quality of accommodation is a combination of several factors – condition of the building, space standards, facilities available etc.	Comment noted.

13.1.14	<p>There is no statement in the report from the Church in Wales agreeing to support the Banw option, if it were selected, nor from the County Council explaining why Church in Wales designation was preferred at Banw</p>	<p>It is true that there is no statement from the Church in Wales agreeing to support the Banw option. The Diocese of St Asaph is a consultee in the process. A consultation response was received from the Diocese which states that ‘the Diocese of St Asaph wishes to support a way forward that enhances the educational opportunities for pupils so that the children of Llanerfyl and Banw, and the wider community can benefit’, and that ‘the Diocese will in partnership with Powys County Council and the local communities support the proposal to establish a new Voluntary Aided Church in Wales school’.</p> <p>The Consultation Document states that the proposal to establish a new Church in Wales School ‘would ensure continued access to Welsh-medium Church in Wales provision’.</p>
13.1.15	<p>Query re the inclusion of Estyn reports going back to 2014 for Llanerfyl School and 2016 for Dyffryn Banw School</p>	<p>The School Organisation Code (2013) states on page 27 that a consultation document must include the following information:</p> <p>‘information from the most recent Estyn reports for each school likely to be affected’</p>
13.1.16	<p>The document and impact assessment fail to adequately consider the impact that closing either site would have on the surrounding village landscape in terms of visual and residential amenity (i.e. potentially creating a vacant/derelict site) – the report states that should the Banw site no longer be required for education then the Council would need to determine how to use the vacant building in future – however, I would suggest that in order to fully consider the impact of closing the school on the community, the Council needs to consider how to use the vacant building/site now.</p> <p>Building on the Banw site is similar to that of Beguildy Primary School which was closed several years ago and remains for sale. Shocked to pass the site recently and see how badly the</p>	<p>These comments regarding the impact of closure of the Banw site on the visual and recreational amenity, and the references to the closure of Beguildy Primary School, are noted.</p> <p>The consultation document and draft impact assessments have been produced in accordance with the requirements of the School Organisation Code (2013). This states on page 28 that the consultation document should include ‘details of any potential transfer or disposal of land or buildings that may need to occur as a result of the proposals.’</p> <p>In respect of the proposal to establish a new school on the Llanerfyl site, the impact on land or buildings is provided on page 41 of the consultation document:</p>

	<p>site had dilapidated since its closure – detracts significantly from the visual amenity of the area and character and appearance of the village.</p> <p>Banw CP School site is in a much more prominent location, on the A458 Trunk Road, a major strategic road linking the Midlands to the coast. Also adjoins two of the largest housing estates in the Banwy Valley. Having such a prominent site left vacant would impact on the residential amenity of nearby residents, would detract from the appearance of the wider community and the impression that people have of the county.</p>	<p>‘ii) Impact on buildings</p> <p>Should a new school be established on the Llanerfyl site, this would mean that the Banw building would be surplus to requirements for the delivery of education.</p> <p>The Banw site is owned by the Council, therefore should the building no longer be required for the delivery of education, it would be declared surplus to requirements and would be disposed of in accordance with the Council’s asset management procedures, with the potential that a capital receipt could be realised. However, the school shares a site with a community hall. This could cause difficulties with any possible sale of the site.’</p> <p>The draft community impact assessment published has been produced in accordance with the guidance provided in the School Organisation Code (2013). The draft assessment will be updated to reflect comments made during the consultation period, and an updated version will be considered when determining how to proceed.</p>
<p>13.2 HoWPS building reports</p>		
<p>13.2.1</p>	<p>Query re the HoWPS building reports – there are several instances where the descriptions of the elements and conditions were the same as Llanerfyl, but Banw was given a higher rating (Dyffryn Banw building report section 3 1.8, 2.7, 4.3. Also section 3.2 and section 3.4)</p>	<p>The Property Condition Surveys produced by HoWPS provide a headline indication of building elements. The coloured rating indicates the surveyor’s assessment of work urgency, hence projects that have a similar description can have a different prioritisation.</p>
<p>13.2.2</p>	<p>Section 3.1 in Llanerfyl’s condition report states that the structural condition has no evidence of structural or movement throughout the whole building, yet in costings, it states cracking to external stonework evident recommend assessment and</p>	<p>Comment noted – there is an inconsistency in the report as the report indicates that a costing of £1,500 for structural assessment is required while the earlier narrative indicates that there is no structural movement within the building.</p>

	initial report from a structural engineer for both Music Room and resource (external wall) and Staff Room (External Wall)	
13.2.3	Feel the costings in the report are biased and unrealistic – it states that both schools need new boilers and both schools need the boiler rooms refurbishing, in fact Llanerfyl needs two boilers replacing. However it says that the work required on Llanerfyl would cost £27000 but Banw’s would cost £80000	The Property Condition Surveys produced by HoWPS provide a headline indication of where likely action is needed, and both schools are identified as requiring attention within the short or medium term. Potential costs were identified with the best information available to hand.

14. COMMENTS RELATING TO THE PROCESS		
14.1 Initial meetings with governing bodies		
14.1.1	Llanerfyl governors did not agree to the closure of their school and the creation of a new school	<p>It is true that the initial contact with the Council was made by Banw C.P. School. Subsequently, separate meetings were held with the two governing bodies, as well as two joint meetings. The minutes of the second of these joint meetings, held on the 15th January 2018, state that:</p> <p>‘Officers asked whether the two governing bodies agreed that closing the two schools and opening a new school would be the most appropriate way to move forward. Some governors commented that they thought that this was the most appropriate way forward.</p> <p>Neither governing body indicated that they disagreed that this was the most appropriate way forward.’</p> <p>However, following the meeting, it is acknowledged that correspondence was received from the governing body of Ysgol Llanerfyl, stating that they had not agreed to close Ysgol Llanerfyl.</p>
14.1.2	At no point in earlier discussions did the governors of Ysgol Llanerfyl agree to closing their school, however we were willing to work in collaboration with Ysgol Dyffryn Banw for the best interests of pupils	
14.1.3	Llanerfyl governors did not agree to close the school. Dyffryn Banw’s headteacher made the first contact to Powys with concerns about pupil numbers. Llanerfyl did not contact Powys because numbers are generally consistent at around the 32-36 mark (with the inclusion of pre year 1 pupils)	

14.2 Informal session for parents held on the 7th February 2018		
14.2.1	Some of the comments written by Ysgol Dyffryn Banw parents showed that Llanerfyl pupils aren't welcome in Banw – comments such as 'Welsh professional snobs', 'we've had to put up with their s*** food now we'll have to put up with their s*** children.' Also nasty personal comments about some of the school's staff	Whilst the comment is noted, the feedback collated after the engagement with parents held in February does not include any evidence of comments such as those quoted here, although it is acknowledged that some comments were made regarding staff.
14.2.2	Shocked and appalled by the written comments from parents of Ysgol Dyffryn Banw during the consultation day held at Llanerfyl on the 7 th February 2018. Parents referred to in a derogatory manner, and negative comments made about pupils.	Whilst the comment is noted, the Council's view is that none of the written comments made by parents of pupils at either school in the initial engagement held in February could be described as 'shocking' or 'appalling'
14.2.3	Reference to use of 'excrement' as descriptions in the informal consultation session.	Whilst the comment is noted, the Council has no evidence the 'excrement' was used as a description in the initial engagement held in February.
14.2.4	Comments suggested negative feelings towards the Welsh language, Llanerfyl children and their families. Some of the comments can be interpreted as racist	Whilst the comment is noted, the Council does not agree that any of the written comments provided were racist.
14.2.5	One of the Banw governors behaved in a threatening way to one of Ysgol Llanerfyl's parents in the car park after the meeting, leaving her very agitated	The Council is unaware that any Banw governors behaved in this manner to one of Ysgol Llanerfyl's parents.
14.2.6	Many parents won't want to send their children to Banw after their experiences during this session	Comment noted. Should the Council proceed with one of the options outlined in the consultation document, the Council would work with the two current schools to establish the new school, and would hope that all pupils currently attending the two schools would transfer to the new schools, regardless of where it is located. However, it is a matter for parents to decide which school they wish their children to attend, and should they prefer for their children to attend an alternative school, they

		could apply for a place in accordance with the Council's Admissions Policy.
14.3 Parents questionnaire Spring 2018		
14.3.1	The conclusion of the questionnaire was that the majority of respondents thought the Banw site was the best place for the new school, despite the majority of responses coming from parents at Llanerfyl school	<p>It is true that the conclusion of the report outlining the findings of the questionnaire distributed to parents of pupils at Banw C.P. School, Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School and Cylch Meithrin Dyffryn Banw in Spring 2018 states the following:</p> <p>'Whilst 16 questionnaires were received from families that currently have children attending Ysgol Llanerfyl, only 11 questionnaires ranked the option of 'A new school operating in the current Llanerfyl building' as their preferred option. In contrast, only 8 questionnaires were received from families that currently have children attending Ysgol Dyffryn Banw, however 12 questionnaires ranked 'A new school operating in the current Dyffryn Banw building' as the preferred option.</p>
14.3.2	A question in the previous questionnaire asked whether parents would send their children to the opposing school. The answers which came back were that a percentage of parents would not be sending their children to the other school, whether it be Banw or Llanerfyl	<p>The questionnaire distributed to parents of pupils at Banw C.P. School, Llanerfyl C. in W. (Foundation) School and Cylch Meithrin Dyffryn Banw in Spring 2018 asked respondents to indicate how likely they were to choose for their children to attend a new school established in the current Dyffryn Banw building or the current Llanerfyl building.</p> <p>10 respondents (36%) stated that they were unlikely or very unlikely to choose for their child/children to attend a new school operating in the current Dyffryn Banw building. 2 respondents (7%) stated that they were unlikely or very unlikely to choose for their child/children to attend a new school operating in the current Llanerfyl building.</p>
14.4 Decision making process		

14.4.1	Hope that this important decision will be made in an honest, unbiased and sensible manner by the members of the Cabinet, and that you will remember that it is the future of our children that is central to this issue	These comments are noted. The Council's aim is to ensure the provision of education of the highest quality for pupils in the Banw Valley area in the future, and the decision on the way forward will be made on this basis.
14.4.2	It's important that the decision is made based on providing the best education for children in the area, on facts and truths, not on emotion and politics	
14.4.3	I trust the intelligence of the panel and Cabinet members to make the correct and most logical decision	
14.4.4	Would have concerns that the well-being and educational needs of pupils aren't at the forefront of decision making if it was decided to move children from a satisfactory school to a poor/bad school from a suitability perspective	
14.4.5	If the decision is for Llanerfyl pupils to come to Banw, the decision will have been made for the community, not because of politics.	
14.4.6	Will the decision be made on costs?	Whilst financial impact is one element to be considered with regard to school reorganisation proposals, this is only one of a number of considerations. The Council's priority is to ensure the best possible education for pupils.
14.5 Reference to Cabinet meeting 18th July 2018		
14.5.1	The site at Llanerfyl scored as a more cost effective and appropriate option in the report presented to Cabinet in July 2018	The report presented to Cabinet in July included an officer recommendation that the new school should be established on the Llanerfyl site, based on an options appraisal carried out by officers.
14.5.2	A detailed report was compiled over a period of 8 months plus. The recommendation made was to site the new school in	However, there was little to choose between the two sites, and

	Llanerfyl, and there was factual and concise evidence to reinforce this recommendation.	therefore, as stated in the minutes of the Cabinet meeting: 'The Portfolio Holder for Finance, Countryside and Transport presented the report and advised that he was proposing an amendment to the recommendation in the report so the consultation would not be specific on which site the new school would be on.'
14.5.3	Why did the Cabinet disregard the outcome of the report by the consultation team in July?	This is part of the democratic process – Cabinet can either accept the recommendations presented to them, amend them or throw them out altogether. There are other occasions where recommendations have been amended at the Cabinet meeting.
14.5.4	How was one councillor able to change the recommendation presented to Cabinet?	The Cabinet member had suggested that it would be fairer for the consultation to include both sites as options. The other Cabinet members had agreed with this, and had supported the amendment.
14.5.5	I asked the Cabinet member why he waited until the afternoon of the Cabinet meeting to come up with another recommendation, and he simply said that he hadn't ready the report correctly prior. Should the future of our children's education be based upon the flippant attitude of one man and completely ignore the views of a team who had spent months compiling the report?	This was the first opportunity the Cabinet member had to discuss this matter with his Cabinet colleagues.
14.5.6	I wonder how much persuading the Chairman of Banw Governing Body did of one of the Cabinet members to change the original recommendation	The Cabinet member was not influenced by anybody to change the original recommendation. He made his judgement on the basis of the paper presented.
14.6 Reference to the consultation process		
14.6.1	Parking and space to drop off and collect the children is an important factor – I did not see highways listed in the list of consultees	The School Organisation Code does not require consultation to take place with highways specifically.

14.6.2	100 or more attended the consultation session in Banw, only 40 or so attended the session in Llanerfyl	It is true that more than 100 attended the drop in consultation session held in Banw Community Hall on the 15 th October 2018, whilst approximately 40 attended the drop in consultation session held in Llanerfyl Village Hall on the 4 th October 2018.
14.7 Reference to process going forward		
14.7.1	Llanerfyl is a Foundation School and a Church in Wales School and any decision relating to its closure would have to be referred to the Welsh Government	<p>The fact that Llanerfyl is a Foundation School and Church in Wales School does not mean that any decision on closure of the school would automatically be referred to the Welsh Government. However the School Organisation Code (2013) does state the following on page 45:</p> <p>‘5.7 Referral of local authority decisions to the Welsh Ministers</p> <p>Under section 54 of the 2013 Act where proposals have been approved or rejected by a local authority the following bodies may within 28 days refer the proposals to the Welsh Ministers for consideration:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Another local authority affected by the proposals; ii. The appropriate religious body for any school affected; iii. The governing body of a voluntary or foundation school subject to the proposals; iv. A trust holding property on behalf of a voluntary or foundation school subject to the proposals; and v. A further education institution affected by the proposals. <p>The bodies making the referral will need to set out why they believe that the decision reached by the local authority is wrong.’</p>

14.7.2	Will the original report that concluded that the proposed new school should be in Llanerfyl still be part of the process?	The work done up until the Cabinet meeting on the 18 th July was considered by Cabinet at that meeting. At the next decision point, Cabinet will be considering the consultation document and the responses received to the consultation. However, most of the information that was included in the original Options Appraisal report is also contained within the consultation document.
14.7.3	In the next step of the process, will the recommendation be made known to the Headteacher and governing body before it goes to Cabinet, as with the previous stage?	The Cabinet papers are published a week before the Cabinet meeting. The Council would endeavour to let the schools know before the papers are published.
14.7.4	Will an extension be needed to the timeline because of the amendment to the consultation made in Cabinet?	No, the timeline is still the same.
14.7.5	How will the temporary governing body be formed?	The temporary governing body would be formed by requesting Expressions of Interest from members of the two existing governing bodies.
14.7.6	Will the local member be allowed to speak in the Cabinet meeting?	Yes, the local member will be allowed to speak as local member. However, she will not be involved in the decision making.
14.7.7	What is the role of the scrutiny committee within this process?	Scrutiny does not have a role in this process. As the consultation report goes to full council for a discussion, it does not go to scrutiny.
14.8 Reference to legal challenge / judicial review		
14.8.1	Apart from the hall matter, all factors conclude in favour of the Llanerfyl site. To conclude otherwise would leave the local authority open to challenge without any basis for their decision based on the information provided	As outlined in the consultation document in respect of the proposals for Banw C.P. School and Llanerfyl C. in W (Foundation) School, there are advantages and disadvantages associated with both site options, and these, as well as the issues raised during the consultation document will be considered by the Cabinet when determining how to proceed.

14.8.2	In today's climate I do not believe the decision to close Llanerfyl could be justified under challenge given the economic factors involved	The Council's priority is to ensure the best possible educational provision for pupils in the Banw Valley for the future.
14.8.3	Any decision must be made with the backing of the information available and distributed, as the decision of closure may well be challenged by both side	
14.8.4	Llanerfyl is clearly the choice the local authority has to make as this is the choice the evidence supports – any decision contrary to Llanerfyl would be difficult, if not impossible to defend by the local authority. Based on the information provided, Llanerfyl should be the preferred site and any decision to the contrary would be open to subsequent challenge	
14.9 Reference to County Councillors		
14.9.1	It's unfair that Cllr Myfanwy Alexander is on the Governing Body of Llanerfyl School – the council sides with her	Cllr Alexander has declared an interest in this matter, and therefore has stepped down as Portfolio Holder for Education for this matter.
14.9.2	The councillor for Banwy should resign as a governor on Llanerfyl School and listen to the views of her electorate and represent the whole area. We need a councillor to speak up for us now more than ever.	
14.9.3	Cllr Alexander should resign as Chair of the friends of Llanerfyl School or step down as a councillor.	
14.9.4	Concern about the impartiality of the local member and her influence in the Council	
14.9.5	How familiar is the Leader of the Council with the area? Has she visited the community?	The Leader of the Council has visited both schools.
14.10 Impact of the process on the community		

14.10.1	I urge you to bring the discussion to an end and make a decision as soon as possible as it is creating bad feeling in the community	The Council acknowledges that any school reorganisation proposal has an impact on the affected communities, and is keen to conclude this process as quickly as possible, in order to minimise this period of uncertainty for the communities involved.
---------	---	--